



Research Article

An Exploration into Iranian Novice versus Experienced EFL Teachers' Perceptions toward a New Model of Teacher Supervision

Ashraf Montaseri ¹, Reza Pajoohan Doost ², Davood Ghahremani ³

1. PhD Candidate, Department of English, Central Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

2. Department of English, Garmsar Branch, Islamic Azad University, Garmsar, Iran

3. Department of English, Garmsar Branch, Islamic Azad University, Garmsar, Iran

* Corresponding author: Reza Pajoohan Doost; Email: Re.pajoohan@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO	ABSTRACT
<p>Submission History</p> <p>Received: 2023-10-01</p> <p>Accepted: 2023-12-23</p> <hr/> <p>Keywords</p> <p>Four-stage supervision model Novice and experienced EFL teachers Standard TPD Model Teachers' professional development (TPD)</p>	<p><i>This study explored novice and experienced EFL teachers' perceptions toward a four-stage (readiness, informing, improvement, evaluation) supervision model administered for developing teachers' professionalism considering different components of a standard Teachers' Professional Development (TPD) model. The participants of the study were 100 novice and 100 experienced male and female EFL teachers with different academic degrees from different regions of Alborz Province. The participants' classes were observed, and appropriate feedback was given (readiness), then a gathering was held, and all the information regarding the procedure of a TPD teacher training course was declared (informing stage). After that, the participants attended a 45-session TPD course through which all the components and subcomponents of the standard TPD model were taught theoretically and practically (improvement stage). Then, the second series of observations were carried out (evaluation stage). Finally, to elicit deep and careful perceptions from participants regarding the effectiveness of the implemented supervision programs, 30 novice and 30 experienced teachers as representatives of the population were randomly interviewed, and the qualitative reports obtained from semi-structured interviews were analyzed thematically. The results represented that although there were some differences between the shortcomings and needs of the two groups, the professionalism of all the participants in different components of the TPD model was highly developed, the deficiencies were to a large extent removed and they were completely satisfied. This study had some implications for the policy-makers, teacher supervisors, teachers, and school principals.</i></p>

Introduction

Supervision emerged at the beginning of the 20th century and was administered intensively in the 18th century. It is an incisive strategy that has a vital role in language teachers' professional development (Chen & Cheng, 2013), classroom management, and teaching practices (Hoque, Subramaniam, & Islam, 2020). Evaluative supervision which is conducted to rate teachers based on their performance in the classroom (Amini & Gholami, 2018; Glickman, Gordon & Ross-Gordon, 2008; Nolan & Hoover, 2005; Pawlas & Oliva, 2007) can improve teachers' performance or disappoint them (Danielson & McGreal, 2000). Supervisor feedback (Amini & Gholami, 2018; Baniabdelrahman, 2004) may threaten the self-image of teachers or motivate them to do better performance and cause growth in the education system (Teddlie, Stringfield, & Burdett, 2003), and students' achievement.

Vast human and financial resources have been expended on teacher development programs (Ghoshooni, 1995; Khany & Azimi Amoli, 2016) but appropriate results have not been met yet. As Moradi, Sepehrifar, and Parhizkar Khadive (2014) reported, language instructors were the followers of supervisors and performers of imposed prescriptions and predetermined models of teaching. In addition, Amini and Gholami (2018) claimed that supervisors apply autocratic observation and just restrict the teachers without providing any helpful recommendations. It was also found less experienced teachers had more negative attitudes toward supervision practice than more experienced teachers (Rahmany, Hasani & Parhoodeh, 2014), and supposed supervisors as fault finders who report their weaknesses to the school managers (Zepeda & Ponticell, 1998). Hence, it is necessary to employ qualified supervisors and evaluators to improve the quality of language instruction (Mette, Aguilar, & Wiczorek, 2020), help teachers to connect theory to practice (Diacopoulos & Butler, 2020), foster their growth, and enhance learners' achievement (Brandon, Hollweck, Donlevy, & Whalen, 2018) based on their needs and their parents' satisfaction (Janssens & Van Amelsvoort, 2008).

During the history of teacher supervision in Iran, there were many supervisors and a lot of

programs but they did not meet the predetermined goals and teachers' expectations (Amini & Gholami, 2018; Azizpour & Gholami, 2021a, 2021b, 2021c; Estaji & Ghiasvand, 2022; Ghoshooni, 1995; Moradi, et al., 2014; Rahmany, Hasani & Parhoodeh, 2014). Maybe the programs were not suitable and efficient or they were not fulfilled as they should be. Therefore, expert and professional supervisors should administer more efficient supervision programs to solve some problems of teachers. On the other hand, as Azizpour and Gholami (2021b) stated, investigating teachers' attitudes toward teacher supervision can inform school principals, supervisors, and EFL teachers of the nature of teacher supervision and can increase the benefits of supervisory practices. Considering these reports, the researchers attempted to do this research to change the procedure of teacher supervision by presenting a new model and changing the perceptions of teachers specifically novice teachers toward supervision programs.

Literature Review

According to Morrison (2005), supervision has four fundamental integrated functions: Management, Development, Support, and Mediation. Depending on the resource pressure and practitioners' needs and support, the delivery of each function is different in practice (Earl, Fox, Webb, & Bowyer, 2017). Supervisors can arouse reflection among teachers (Jaeger, 2013) by analyzing the beliefs of teachers, interrogating the activities of educational systems, and investigating the teaching process (Zeichner & Liston, 1987). Reaching the point that the act of teaching becomes the main source of knowledge is the goal of supervision and improving the range of experiences and knowledge that a teacher carries in the classroom is the basic function of the supervisor that leads to improvement in learning (Sergiovanni & Starratt, 2007). Providing opportunities for implementing high-quality teacher supervision programs and enhancing teachers' professional development is the function of the education system (Arong & Ogbadu, 2010).

Moradi, et al. (2014) explored the perceptions of EFL teachers concerning being observed during teaching by a supervisor. It was found that teachers

tried to please the supervisors, they were worried about their scores and their consequences; sometimes they believed observation and feedback were superficial and sometimes they felt, the supervisors were intentionally finding weaknesses, causing trouble and damaging their confidence.

Rahmany, Hasani, and Parhoodeh (2014) explored the Iranian EFL teachers' attitudes toward supervision, and also examined the relationship between teachers' teaching experience and their attitudes towards classroom supervision. It was found that teachers with less than five years of experience were more influenced by the supervision process. They believed that supervision programs were very important for their classroom improvement and their teaching skills. The most pessimist teachers had six to ten years of experience. The results of the qualitative analysis revealed that the supervision program seemed to be only paperwork for teachers with more than 16 years of experience.

Eryilmaz and Mutlu (2017) introduced a four-stage model including Readiness Stage, Informing Stage, Improvement Stage, and Evaluation Stage, for having more effective supervised sessions. It was revealed that the use of that model reduced the counselor trainees' mistakes, and was beneficial for their counselor competencies in eight important dimensions.

Azizpour and Gholami (2021b) investigated seven teacher-supervisors' attitudes toward supervision in Iranian language schools through semi-structured interviews. The findings indicated that supervisors' workload is too demanding with many other non-supervisory responsibilities. In addition, the supervisors were unsatisfied with some ethical contacts they encountered such as critically commenting on their colleagues' performance and annoying other teachers. Another finding was that teacher supervisors are assigned to supervisory roles due to their eminent teaching capabilities, merits, and experience without any training. The results also detected that language school managers do not have any evident criteria or rubric for selecting supervisors.

Azizpour and Gholami (2021c) investigated EFL teachers' attitudes toward supervision in Iranian language schools. The findings revealed that a great number of the participants found the

implemented supervision useful for themselves and necessary for novice teachers, however, some had negative attitudes toward supervision and their supervisors' feedback. For supervision improvement, they suggested the development of transparent criteria and the discontinuation of unannounced observation.

Estaji and Ghiasvand (2022) examined the perceptions of Iranian EFL teachers with different experience levels toward various supervisory practices and their contribution to teacher pedagogical growth. It was found that both novice and experienced teachers had a negative view concerning the existing supervision system in Iran and there was not any significant difference between the novice and experienced EFL teachers' attitudes about classroom supervision. Both groups considered supervision as a bureaucratic, fault-finding, confidence-reducing practice with little to no educational value, and they believed that the quality of supervision affects its results and it is useful only for novice teachers.

Reviewing literature revealed that there is not any Iranian research comparing the effect of teacher supervision programs on different components of EFL teachers' professional development considering a specific TPD model and also exploring novice and experienced EFL teachers' viewpoints toward a specific supervision model. To fill this gap, the researchers were motivated to conduct this study with the hope that some of the shortcomings of teacher training programs and teacher supervision practices can be solved by receiving the opinions and suggestions of novice and experienced teachers. This study will address the following quantitative research question:

What are the perceptions of Iranian novice versus experienced EFL teachers toward a new model of teacher supervision?

Methodology

Participants

One hundred novice and 100 experienced, male and female (41 male and 59 female) EFL teachers from urban and rural regions of Alborz Province, teaching in state junior and senior high schools with different degrees of education, BA, MA, and PhD participated in this study voluntarily. Novice teachers were beginner teachers aged

between 22-40 and experienced teachers were teachers with more than three-year experience aged between 25-48. The participants were not informed about the purpose of the study and they had the chance to withdraw from the study whenever they wanted. To explore the perceptions of the participants toward the effectiveness of the new teacher supervision model, 30 novice (NovTs henceforth) and 30 experienced (ExpTs henceforth) EFL teachers randomly selected from the whole population of the study were interviewed.

Instruments

The perceptions of about one-third (30 NovTs & 30 ExpTs) of the whole population (100 NovTs and 100 ExpTs) who were invited randomly were elicited through free discussions. The semi-structured interview questions were adapted from Moradi et al. (2014) and consisted of five open-ended questions; number one elicited the teachers' opinions toward the supervision procedure in the Education System; number two elicited their perceptions toward their last observation, the quality of the feedback they had received and the effect of that feedback on their confidence level; the third question asked them about their satisfaction with the current supervision system; number four asked them what was important to be observed in their opinion, and the fifth one elicited their suggestions for supervision improvement. Finally, the participants were asked to share anything else from their experience with supervision practice.

Procedures

The procedure of the study was carried out based on a four-stage model proposed by Eryilmaz and Mutlu (2017). They designed this model based on both Egan's (1975 as cited in Eryilmaz and Mutlu, 2017) skilled helper model and the principles and techniques of counseling (Carkhuff, 2000; Cormier & Hackney, 2008; Egan, 1975; Ivey, Ivey, Zalaquett, and Quirk, 2010 as cited in Eryilmaz and Mutlu, 2017). This model encompasses four stages: readiness stage, informing stage, improvement stage, and evaluation stage. Supervision was administered by four experienced, knowledgeable TEFL PhD holder supervisors with professional ethics and behavior, each one from one main district of Alborz Province, with the

cooperation of six experienced, knowledgeable PhD holder teacher trainers, each one expert in some subcomponents of TPD, under the leadership of the researchers. This study started from the first session of English classes in the academic year 2022-2023 and ended in the last session of English classes in the same academic year.

Stage 1 (Readiness). Before receiving permission on the part of school principals and teachers (a short time about one hour before observation), the supervisors had a warm dialogue with the teachers and then observed their classes so that they entered the classes with the teachers and left the classes with them. During class, the supervisors carefully observed everything and filled out the observation form. After observation and determination of the strengths and weaknesses of the teacher's performance, the supervisors gave feedback to the teacher so that they reported the strong points and particular abilities of the teachers to the teachers themselves and the school principals to encourage the teachers to develop them and then told the weak points mildly to the teachers confidentially and offered constructive guidelines. If a teacher lacked the capacity to hear weak points, the supervisors kept them and added them to their collection to bring up them during the TPD course indirectly and offer recommendations for removing or decreasing them. The teachers' virtual classes in SHAD (local application of the Education System) were also observed so that the supervisors were added to the classes by the school principals or the teachers and they were allowed to observe the classes online or offline (after the COVID-19 Pandemic, in addition to face-to-face class, every teacher has a virtual class in SHAD).

Stage 2 (Informing Stage). After pre-observations were finished by supervisors, a gathering was held and all the participants were invited. Through the gathering, the weak points and shortcomings observed during the pre-observations were explained by one of the supervisors, and the participants' questions were answered. The attendees were informed of the existing problems and were invited to attend a TPD course in the form of a series of workshops to solve the problems mentioned. They were informed of the timetable and the number of workshops as well as activities

and practices that would be performed there. The experienced and knowledgeable teachers who had been identified and determined through the pre-observations were also introduced through this gathering and they were respectfully invited to share their experiences with other teachers, particularly NovTs through sample teachings.

Stage 3 (Improvement Stage). In this stage, the participants attended the workshops so that 45 two-hour workshops were pre-designed, and each week one subcomponent of the standard TPD model was taught and practiced during three two-hour workshops. Shortcomings and weak points regarding each sub-component of the Standard TPD Model were explained, clarified, and discussed; and constructive suggestions were offered by supervisors. The necessary theories and principles were also taught theoretically by teacher trainers. Subcomponents of content knowledge and pedagogical knowledge were taught by a knowledgeable TEFL PhD holder teacher trainer; subcomponents of lesson management, classroom climate control, and supportive emotional skills were taught by a psychology PhD holder teacher trainer; critical thinking skills, reflection, and self-evaluation were taught by a sociology PhD holder teacher trainer; technological knowledge and its subcomponents were taught by a TEFL PhD holder teacher trainer expert in educational technology; planning and preparation and lesson presentation were taught by a TEFL PhD holder teacher trainer expert in curriculum development, and assessing students' progress was taught by a TEFL PhD holder teacher trainer expert in assessment and evaluation. It should be added that all the teacher trainers had experience in supervision, too. The knowledgeable, experienced, skillful, and professional teachers who had been selected and invited by the supervisors were asked to demonstrate their best teaching in front of the participants (each day, one or two demonstrations), and they were also asked to share their experiences with the participants and mention the key and strong points of their practices in the classroom. After each demonstration, a critical interaction was run among participants respectfully, and during critical interactions, the supervisors managed the workshops and recommended useful guidelines while considering the dignity of the demonstrators.

In fact, they were playing the role of a leader, advisor, counselor, and guide during discussions and interactions. The workshops finished after the 15th week.

Stage 4 (Evaluation Stage). The same supervisors carried out the second series of observations (post-observations) in face-to-face and virtual classes. The post-observations were carried out to investigate the effect of the supervision programs, specifically the TPD course, on the different components and sub-components of the professional development of all the participants.

Finally, in order to elicit deep and careful information, 30 NovTs and 30 ExpTs were randomly interviewed through a semi-structured interview adapted from Moradi et al, (2014). The interview questions were open-ended and the supervisors had an opportunity to discuss with the participants freely. For anonymity, a code was given to each participant, for example, NovT1 (novice teacher 1), and ExpT1 (experienced teacher 1), and they were assured that their information would remain confidential. Each interview lasted 30 to 40 minutes and it was recorded with the interviewee's permission.

Data Analysis

For analyzing the data elicited from the participants through semi-structured interviews (Moradi, et al., 2014), Braun and Clarke's (2006) six-phase framework was followed. In step one, the recorded insightful perceptions and attitudes of participants were transcribed verbatim, they were read and re-read several times. In step two, the data was organized in a meaningful and systematic way and then, general initial codes were found manually. In step three, the codes were organized into broader themes; in step four, the preliminary themes were reviewed, modified and developed; in step five, the themes were refined and some sub-themes emerged, and the relation and interaction among themes and sub-themes was analyzed, and in step six, the results of the thematic analyses were written up.

Results

The content of the participants' responses to interview questions was analyzed considering Braun and Clarke's (2006) six-phase framework. The

main themes were (1) Teacher Supervision System in Iran's Education System, (2) Effects of Teacher Supervision on Teachers' Performance, (3) Preferred factors for observation, (4) Different Types of Feedback, (5) Satisfaction with the New Four-stage Supervision Model, (6) Teachers' Suggestions for Developing the Teacher Supervision System, (7) Some Reported Unpleasant or ineffectual Supervision Experiences. Most of the themes and sub-themes are hierarchically demonstrated in Table 1, and some excerpts related to each other are presented as evidence. The data related to some themes and sub-themes are explained descriptively, because it was not possible to explain them in the table. Some categories for the sake of overlap between NovTs and ExpTs are mentioned as the common results out of the Table 1 while some themes and sub-themes are just mentioned in Table 1.

Effects of Teacher Supervision on Teachers' Performance

It is obvious that the administration of every program in each system has some positive or negative effects on different elements of that system, and the teacher supervision program is not an exception to this rule. All the participants of both groups, NovTs and ExpTs, believed that if teacher supervision is fulfilled by a qualified supervisor, it will have positive effects on teacher performance and student learning.

Positive Effects

These are the common positive effects mentioned by both groups: synergy, teachers' professional development, increasing self-confidence and self-esteem, integrity in education, moving toward common goals, improving the quality of teaching, reduction of weaknesses, sharing experiences, useful strategies and techniques, review or learning of applied theories, strengthening the spirit and sense of dynamism and vitality in gatherings, and increasing motivation and job satisfaction.

Negative Effects

These are the common negative effects mentioned by both groups: stress, changing the routine nature of the classroom, the teacher performance and also the students' performance, using as a means for bothering teachers by managers, finding the weak points and highlighting

them, seeing the observed teacher who has some weaknesses as a sinner by some supervisors, assessing the teacher by pre-designed non-standard forms, reporting the weak points to the school manager and higher authorities, reducing the observed teacher's annual assessment score as a punishment, and maybe changing the observed teacher's school to lower graded school.

Preferred factors for observation

Preferred factors for observation were mostly the same in the opinion of both NovTs and ExpTs. They mentioned these factors: teacher's knowledge, method of teaching, having an annual and daily lesson plan, procedure of lesson presentation, classroom management, familiarity and ability to use technological tools for teaching and testing, formative and summative assessment, rapport and interaction between teacher and students, students' engagement, teacher's creativity, being up-to-date, students' stress-free sense in the classroom, motivating and encouraging students for learning, students' interest in the subject matter and their teacher, students' activities and behaviors, school problems and shortcomings, number of students in each class, professional behavior.

Satisfaction with the New Four-stage Supervision Model

The responses to interview question 3 revealed that both groups of participants, NovTs and ExpTs, were deeply satisfied with the current administered four-stage supervision model. They had some reasons for their satisfaction. Their reasons are presented through some examples extracted from NovTs and ExpTs' responses to interview questions 2 and 3. As an example, ExpT 25 declared, "*The currently administered supervision covered all the possible components of the TPD program necessary for both novice and experienced teachers*".

As was mentioned earlier, the TPD standard model used in the current supervision program as the theory included three main components: knowledge, skills, and TPD programs. Therefore, the researchers tried to present the sample excerpts considering the main components respectively (see Table 1).

Knowledge

The knowledge component of the standard TPD model included some subcomponents. All

these sub-components were taught theoretically and practically during the administered TPD course. The satisfaction and appreciation of all the participants, NovTs and ExpTs, from the held TPD programs focusing on the knowledge sub-components including content knowledge, pedagogical knowledge, and technological knowledge are evidenced through some sample excerpts (see Table 1).

Skills

Approximately all the skills necessary for a teacher are included in the standard TPD model and they were taught theoretically and practically during the administered TPD course or through the given feedbacks. The satisfaction of all the

participants, NovTs and ExpTs, from the administered programs considering all the subcomponents of skills, will be obvious through the excerpts in Table 1.

Teachers' Suggestions for Developing the Regular Teacher Supervision System

The participants of this study knew that this program was administered with the efforts of the researcher, but the researcher spared no pains to do the best. Therefore, both groups considering the shortcomings and some impediments that the researcher struggled with had some suggestions for developing the teacher supervision system, (see Table 1).

Table 1

Content analysis of the data collected from NovTs and ExpTs through the interview

Themes	Sub-themes	NovTs' Excerpts	ExpTs' Excerpts
Teacher supervision system in Iran's Education System	Inner-school supervision system	The principal or his/her assistant's supervision is not very useful and professional, because s/he is not a specialist in different fields to evaluate teachers' performance, specifically their knowledge. Observation should be run by an expert, and experienced supervisor in the same field.	Inner-school supervision system includes two types: supervision and leadership which is run by the principal of the school or his/her assistants, and peer supervision which is fulfilled by one colleague in the same field. Peer supervision is useful because we can become aware of our colleague's experiences.
	Outer-school supervision system	... as I have heard from experienced teachers, the district supervisor monitors the activities of district teachers and the province supervisor monitors the performance of district supervisors and all the teachers of the province. Supervision by an expert and professional supervisor is necessary for us.	The outer-school supervision system is fulfilled by a distinguished, expert, knowledgeable teacher with a bright history as a supervisor who may be a province supervisor or district supervisor, ... Expert supervisors can help teachers to solve their academic weaknesses.
	Supervision with announcement or without announcement (different opinions)	Observation without announcement is stressful and affects the performance of the teacher. When the teacher is informed that his/her class is going to be observed, prepares everything in the best way and tries to do the best. Supervision should be fulfilled in a real and regular situation so that the supervisor can observe shortcomings and try to solve the problems.	I think observation without announcement is not an ethical and professional action; the teacher should be informed at least some minutes before observation. When the teacher is informed of observation in advance the routine procedure of the classroom will be changed as far as the class may be changed with a subjective and equipped classroom.
Different types of feedback	Positive or negative	Some supervisors see the filled half of the glass and just mention the strong points but some of them just search for weak points and try to	A supervisor can increase the teacher's motivation and interest in the teaching profession with a positive view, and on the contrary, with a negative view, s/he can cause frustration and

Themes	Sub-themes	NovTs' Excerpts	ExpTs' Excerpts
		blame the teachers, especially beginner teachers.	discouragement of a teacher, especially a beginner teacher.
	Fair or Unfair	Sometimes managers or their assistants through inner-school supervision present unfair feedback by filling out a predesigned form biasedly and reporting to the higher authorities causing trouble for the teacher while they aren't experts and specialists in EFL.	A fair supervisor sees the strengths as sees the weaknesses, and helps the teacher to develop the strong points and remove the weak points by offering guidelines. Fairness is one of the characteristics of a professional supervisor, ...
	Verbal or Nonverbal	Some supervisors just fill out forms and do not provide verbal feedback, while talking to the teacher can have a huge impact on improving the quality of teacher's performance.	A supervisor must fill out a predesigned form after observation and present it to the school manager and higher authorities. It is possible for the supervisor to mention the weak points verbally and confidentially and guide the teacher but fill out the form positively.
	Confidential or Nonconfidential	One day, at the request of the school principal, a supervisor entered my class without prior notice, it was very stressful and I wasn't in a regular manner. She observed the class for about fifteen minutes and left, then I was called for feedback. Pointing out my weaknesses in front of the principal and school staff frustrated me and reduced my self-confidence.	A professional supervisor points out the teacher's weaknesses in confidence and offers solutions not in front of the principal and school staff. If a teacher's weaknesses are mentioned in front of the school principal, it will cause frustration and heartbreak for the teacher ...
	Direct or Indirect	Not considering the spirit and dignity of the teacher and stating his/her weaknesses sharply and directly may cause resentment and disappointment in the teacher and hurt his performance.	It is better to consider the teacher's criticism capacity, and with a professional decision, mention some weaknesses indirectly during the discussion after observation or invite him/her to a TPD program and notice the weak points there and provide solutions.
Satisfaction with the New Four-stage Supervision Model	Knowledge	Content Knowledge Through the implemented teacher training course, all the useful theories that we had learned in university were reviewed and their practical uses were taught.	Before this course, I didn't know anything about post-method theories and I had forgotten theories of learning, even the useful methods of teaching.
		Pedagogical Knowledge The recommendations offered by supervisors taught me that I should behave with different students differently.	I learned how to do pair work and group work practically.
		Technological Knowledge Before this course, I didn't know how to produce an educational video, how to cut and paste the useful parts of a video or a voice, and how to compress a file and reduce its volume.	Before this course, I didn't know which applications were better for different purposes in face-to-face, virtual or online classes, and which websites are better for downloading appropriate files and introducing them to students.

Themes	Sub-themes	NovTs' Excerpts	ExpTs' Excerpts
	Skills	<p>Planning and Preparation</p> <p>I'm very appreciative of learning how to write a unified national lesson plan in this teacher training course; up to now, I was confused about how to write a good lesson plan.</p>	<p>Throughout all the years of my teaching, I didn't know how to write a good lesson plan, I had to copy, I owe learning how to write a unified national lesson plan to this course.</p>
		<p>Lesson Presentation</p> <p>Demos were very interesting, we understood how to teach different subjects, how to assess students' learning through teaching, and how to engage students.</p>	<p>Supervisors' guidelines informed me that some of the methods and strategies that I used to do in my classes were not suitable for the age of my students so I will change them to more suitable ones; I will motivate them to do more creative activities.</p>
		<p>Lesson Management</p> <p>Theories presented by the psychologist teacher trainer [releasing happy hormones, deep breathing theory, resilience theory, ...] were very useful for developing classroom management, classroom climate control, and supportive emotional skills. Through supervisors' guidelines, I learned how to manage the time spent on different subjects so that I don't fall behind the predesigned schedule or I don't come too far ahead of it.</p>	<p>Group work and pair work tasks and activities that were taught practically by supervisors and some expert colleagues were very useful and helpful for engaging students during class time. Psychologist teacher trainer taught us how to keep our spirits up and not lose hope when we face challenges.</p>
		<p>Classroom Climate Control</p> <p>The supervisors taught us how to foster students' self-confidence and self-esteem by giving positive feedback. I learned that we should select topics related to the student's experiences to encourage and motivate them to present creative activities.</p>	<p>The procedure of group work and pair work and selecting teacher assistants in each classroom shared by one experienced teacher can improve the engagement of students in the process of teaching and learning and develop their achievement. We learned how to save mutual respect through friendly relationships.</p>
		<p>Assessing Students' Progress</p> <p>Before this program, I was confused about how to assess different skills, what are the standard criteria for the final exam, how to record the students' scores, how to calculate the final score,</p>	<p>The supervisors recommended that we can encourage students to assess their own progress through different tasks and they taught us how to do them practically.</p>
		<p>Reflection and Self-evaluation</p> <p>After passing the current teacher training course, I learned to review my class activities and the time spent</p>	<p>Before this course, supervisors' suggestions weren't important to me at all, but now I have decided to pay attention to their</p>

Themes	Sub-themes	NovTs' Excerpts	ExpTs' Excerpts
		on different parts every day and make changes if needed.	recommendations carefully and apply them and connect the supervisors whenever I have a problem.
	Critical Thinking Skills	Sociologist teacher trainer presented valuable points, suggestions, and examples for developing our critical thinking skills.	Through interactive reviews after each demo, all of us learned to develop our capacity for accepting supervisors' feedback and criticism.
	Supportive Emotional Skills	Through this program, we as novice and inexperienced teachers learned how to deal with and interact with students with behavioral problems, how to tolerate shortcomings, and look for suitable solutions. We learned how to behave students as a human whose future is in our hands.	Supervisors' recommendations taught us how to respect our student's ideas and opinions; they taught us how to support our students' performance in the classroom. This teacher training course motivated us to be creative teachers and encourage our students to do creative projects.
	TPD Programs	Sharing experiences	The shared experiences of experienced teachers helped me to solve some of my problems.
		Observation	The supervisors' guidelines and recommendations answered a lot of my questions.
		Feedback	One day morning, the supervisor contacted me that she is coming to school to observe my class one hour later, ..., it was very professional that she informed me one hour before observation because it wasn't stressful as a surprise observation, and at the same time, I didn't have a chance to present an artificial performance, and everything was real. The supervisor entered the class with me, ..., he had a warm communication with students and me, he observed everything carefully and patiently, ..., and left the class with me, ..., I think that it wasn't a formality, and it was completely purposeful.
			After observing my virtual class in SHAD, the supervisor called me, appreciated me, and mentioned my strengths, and then in a gentle but effective and friendly tone raised some objections and put forth helpful recommendation, I think, it was completely fair, and gave me a good sense that there is a supervisor who sees us and in addition, appreciates our efforts.

Themes	Sub-themes	NovTs' Excerpts	ExpTs' Excerpts
		confidence and encouraged me to do more creative activities in my class.	..., the supervisor's behavior motivated me to participate in the TPD course, up-to-date myself, and remove my weaknesses.
		Supervisors The supervisors were knowledgeable, experienced, and compassionate supervisors. ..., the supervisor was expert, committed, and fair with professional ethics.	I understood from the last observation of my class that the purpose of the supervisor was not paperwork and fault finding, but helping and guiding the teacher. ..., the supervisor's positive view and constructive interaction with me and my students changed my negative attitude toward the act of supervision.
		Teacher trainers Inviting a group of expert teacher trainers in different fields in addition to TEF such as technology, psychology, and sociology for teaching different components of TPD theoretically and practically was an interesting opportunity for us as beginner teachers.	Teacher trainers of the current course were experienced teachers who were also university professors and Alborz province supervisors in their own field and this was a kind of creativity in supervision history.
Teachers' Suggestions for Developing the Teacher Supervision System	Continuation and repetition of the current programs	Despite the shortcomings and lack of facilities, the current supervision program is working well. I hope it continues and gets better year by year.	The current supervision program is a comprehensive, practical, and dynamic program. It can develop the quality of education if it continues in the future.
	The Department of Education's financial and non-financial support	Allocating more time to supervision so that the supervisors just concentrate on supervision programs and have enough time to observe a teacher's class full time, assess all the effective factors, give constructive feedback, offer solutions and follow up the shortcomings and problems will significantly develop the quality of education. Supervisors should have enough authority to present different certificates, cash or non-cash prizes to teachers who participate in different projects to increase competition among them and attract them to programs that develop their professionalism.	Providing transportation for observing all the teachers' classes and tracking defects, and allocating enough budget for establishing meetings, workshops, gatherings, and conferences, absolutely will develop the outcomes of supervision programs. Allocating a time with payment for teachers' voluntary participation in teacher training courses. Providing transportation and catering for volunteer teachers who come from distant regions.
	Employing competent supervisors	Supervision should be done by experienced and specialist supervisors with a regular and detailed schedule for continuous supervision throughout the academic year, not for paperwork and	Supervisors should be expert, experienced, compassionate, and efficient, they should adhere to ethical principles and believe in work conscience, they should believe in their valuable mission and try to do their best

Themes	Sub-themes	NovTs' Excerpts	ExpTs' Excerpts
		formality but for teachers' professional growth.	to reach their goal which is developing the quality of teaching and learning.
	Substitutions for supervisor supervision	I think colleagues from the same field in each school or even different schools can observe each other's classes, two by two or even more, and benefit from each other's experiences and strengths, and try to remove each other's weaknesses in a friendly manner. Self-assessment and students' assessment are good substitutions for supervisor supervision.	Peer supervision is a good substitution for supervisor supervision because its stress is less than supervisor supervision and therefore it may be more effective. Lesson research is a kind of effective supervision that can be a good substitution for supervisor supervision, and decreases the load of work on the supervisor, and it is better to do it with the cooperation and guidance of the supervisor.
	Clarification	To decrease the stress of supervision, teachers should be aware of the supervision criteria which are mentioned through predesigned forms by sharing them through virtual groups.	The supervision system should be transparent, ..., and teachers should become aware of the necessity of the existence of supervision programs.

Discussion

As the results indicated, following the recommendations of Azizpour and Gholami (2021c), Chen and Cheng (2013), Janssens and Van Amelsvoort (2008), and Moradi et al. (2014), the supervisors after observing the classes, consultation with teachers and collecting a corpus of shortcomings, weaknesses, and needs of teachers and students, administered a comprehensive teacher training course that highly improved the participants' professionalism, and the quality of their instruction (Danielson & McGreal, 2000). Also, following the suggestion of Azizpour and Gholami (2021c), the statements of the participants showed the manner of giving feedback and presenting recommendations in the current supervision program improved the teachers' specifically, NovTs' self-confidence and certainty of the correctness of their performance in the classroom. In contrast to the claims of some studies such as Amini and Gholami (2018), Azizpour and Gholami (2021c), Glickman, Gordon and Ross-Gordon (2008), Moradi et al. (2014), Nolan and Hoover (2005), and Pawlas and Oliva (2007), the results showed that the procedure of the current supervision programs and the behavior of the supervisors did not increase the teachers' anxiety, did not damage their self-confidence and motivation, was not bureaucratic, autocratic or paperwork. Instead, considering the recommendations of Azizpour and Gholami

(2021b), and Moradi et al. (2014), it was helpful, humanitarian, constructive, encouraging and problem solver with mutual respect and rapport. Contrary to the claims of Azizpour and Gholami (2021c), and Moradi et al. (2014), the comments and guidelines of the supervisors were not imposed on the teachers, and their feedbacks were not superficial or unsatisfactory, but in opposition to the claim of Rahmany et al. (2014), all the participant were satisfied and all the programs were voluntary and in line with the development of teachers' professional growth and students' achievement. In response to the claim of Azizpour and Gholami (2021b), the four supervisors of the current study were knowledgeable PhD holders, TEFL teachers with more than five-year experience in supervision, they were expert and skillful, and considering the recommendations of Esia-Donkoh and Ofosu-Dwamena (2014), as the reports of the participants revealed the supervisors were not fault finders, they were trustful, committed, empathetic, with professional behavior and flexibility, and they tried to find shortcomings, and remove them through constructive and friendly dialogue, and implementing useful TPD programs. As it is inferred from the results, weakening the claim of Azizpour and Gholami (2021b, 2021c) all the teacher supervisors in the education system have some checklists for different purposes, such as observation, inspection, and evaluation of final exam questions, but they have some shortcomings

and deficiencies that must be removed. It is also worth noting that the supervisors of this study had a comprehensive 75-item observation form adapted from the standard TPD model of Khany and Azimi Amoli (2016) which is recommended to be revised by eliminating some unnecessary items and can be used for future observations. Considering the suggestion of Azizpour and Gholami (2021c), all the observations were administered with the announcement but less than one hour before observation in order to lower the teacher's stress and at the same time and limit the opportunity for artificial performance in the classroom.

Conclusion

The findings of the study revealed that all the participants, NovTs and ExpTs, were deeply satisfied with the currently implemented supervision model in general and had a positive attitude toward each practice fulfilled through it. All the participants deeply appreciated not only for the punctilious, precise, detailed, and careful procedures and the content of the teacher training course but also for the ethical and professional behavior of supervisors and teacher trainers.

According to the procedure of the current supervision model and the results of the study, it is needed that the Department of Technology and Educational Groups of each district select a group of experienced and knowledgeable teachers and train them for observation under the leadership of the district or province supervisor, and in return give them some privileges. The classes of all the teachers should be observed by the observers at least once per every semester and if there is a problem, it should be solved by the observers and district supervisor; if not, help should be sought from the province supervisor.

For the supervisor to gain the trust of the teachers, it is better to fill the observation form with a positive view, to announce the strengths to the manager, and if there are any weaknesses, tell the teacher in a friendly manner and confidential, and give constructive and practical recommendations. If the teacher lacks enough capacity, talk to him gently and invite him/her to the teacher's professional development programs, and those weaknesses that s/he could not bear to hear directly should be

pointed out indirectly, and appropriate solutions should be provided.

The supervisors of each district should collect the shortcomings and weak points of teachers' performances after the first series of observations and considering their needs, establish a teachers' professional development course. It is recommended that the course be a combination of virtual and face-to-face training because teaching some components of TPD such as technology is more successful in virtual form. The TPD model used in this study (Khany & Azimi Amoli, 2016) is a comprehensive model so that the ExpT25 declared, "nothing was left during this teacher training course".

As the TPD model used in this study is a broad model that includes seven sub-components with 29 items for the knowledge component and eight sub-components with 68 items for skills, it takes into account almost all the needs of a NovT and an ExpT. Items of knowledge consider all the theories, methods, approaches, principles, activities, and projects in the field, and also all the traditional and current technological vehicles and applications used in the field. The knowledge component also includes items that consider the interplay among different sub-components (content, pedagogy, and technology) simultaneously and the integration of technology into the teaching process. On the other hand, items of skills consider both the theoretical knowledge of teachers and their practical ability. Items of *Planning and Preparation*, focus on teachers' ability to design their lesson plans with clear and suitable aims and objectives and their ability to prepare learning activities and out-of-class works to sustain their students' progress and to encourage their creativity. Items of *Lesson Presentation* concentrate on teachers' enthusiasm for delivering instructions and explanations matched to their students, their ability to ask a variety of questions, their ability to actively involve their students in the lesson and to encourage autonomy in the learning activity. *Lesson Management* items underline teachers' ability to induce a positive mental set among students, to maintain their students' attention, interest, and involvement in the lesson, to adjust and maintain the pace and flow of the lesson at an appropriate level, and to set up group work activities. *Classroom*

Climate Control items stress teachers' ability to establish a positive, warm, and friendly classroom climate, to support and encourage their students, to build teacher-student relationships based on mutual respect, to provide encouraging feedback, and to provide real chances for their students' success. Items of *Assessing Students' Progress* highlight teachers' ability to use a variety of marking methods, to use an appropriate variety of assessment activities, to provide their students with diagnostic and corrective feedback, to file written fair, valid, meaningful, and informative reports and to encourage their students to assess their own work. *Reflection and Self-evaluation* items investigate teachers' ability to evaluate their own work, to work with other teachers to develop their own classroom practice, to keep records of their appraisals for future consideration, and to review their strategies and techniques which they use to deal with sources of stress. Items of *Critical Thinking Skills* weigh teachers' ability to recognize their students' learning problems, to critically observe their students and give useful comments, to leave a space for self-criticism, and to challenge established theories and concepts in the field. *Supportive Emotional Skills* items emphasize teachers' ability to show respect for their students' ideas, to consider students' personal concerns, to respect their colleagues as well as their students' authority and creativity, and to listen to others' advice but make autonomous decisions.

Although there were some slight differences between the NovTs and ExpTs, all the participants of both groups were highly satisfied with the selection of this model, and it can be interpreted from the results that it highly developed their professionalism. The NovTs were at a higher level in general English and theoretical parts such as different learning theories, post-method theories, and different methods of teaching, but they did not know how to use the theories effectively in practice. They did not have any practical experience in formative and summative assessment of different skills, as well as online or virtual teaching and assessment and the related needs specifically through SHAD. On the other hand, the old teachers had good experiences in classroom management, dealing with different students, directions, frameworks and criteria for formative

and summative assessments, and also, after COVID-19, they had gained some experiences regarding teaching and assessment through SHAD and other local applications and online assessment which they shared in this course and both groups benefited from each other's attendance. In addition, sample teachings presented by capable teachers and followed by interactive criticisms, psychological techniques practically trained by the psychologist, different critical thinking skills taught by the sociologist, writing a national lesson plan taught by a TEFL teacher trainer, and supervisors' guidelines and hints were other prominent parts of the current TPD course which were highly received by the teachers.

After passing the TPD course, it is recommended that the classes of all the participants be observed again to see the results of the teacher training course and other efforts and guidance of the supervisors, and if there are any remaining shortcomings, the problems should be solved by providing appropriate feedback and useful recommendations in one or more sessions.

This study also found that considering the shortcomings of surprise and also preannounced observation, it is better to announce the teacher about one hour before observation. For supervision transparency, all the supervision checklists should be shared with the teachers in virtual groups at the beginning of each semester. To obtain more information about teachers' performance, their students should be interviewed, however, not ignoring students' mischief, and at last, as an appropriate substitution for supervisor supervision, peer supervision and lesson research should be developed.

The findings of this study have some implications for policymakers, teacher supervisors, teachers, and school principals. Policymakers should allocate more budget to supervision programs specifically observation, and teacher training courses; increase the working hours of supervisors to concentrate more on supervision programs and employ a group of professional pre-trained supervisors for each subject, the most experienced as the head member and others as the group members. They should also increase the executive power and authority of supervisors to be able to give financial and non-financial privileges to

active teachers and attract them to different programs and improve competition among them. Moreover, policymakers need to allocate fees, transportation, and catering to teacher trainers and participants of professional development courses out of duty hours, and eventually, repeat the current administered supervision model in future years by supporting the supervisors.

Teacher supervisors should observe the classes patiently; they should not be disappointed and unmotivated because positive actions can be taken despite all the shortcomings. They need to have a deep sense of responsibility, and compassionately seek to solve the teachers' problems and meet their needs. They are also required to concentrate on supervision programs and answer the teachers' questions because supervisors are the communication channel between the teachers and the Education Office.

On the other hand, teachers should welcome the supervisors to observe their classrooms and cooperate with them. They should be open to supervisors' comments, and show respect for their feedback to improve their capacity for criticism and hearing weak points. Teachers need to listen to the supervisors' recommendations and make autonomous decisions by considering the school and class conditions. Finally, school principals should cooperate with supervisors, and present the realities to them; they should not hide anything from their view, nor should they consider teacher supervision as a means to trouble the teacher and to expel him/her from the school, but consider it as a means to improve the quality of the teacher's professionalism.

As a new model of supervision in the Education System, this study suffered from a number of limitations. First, the participants of this study included both genders with different ages and different academic degrees. Second, the population of this study had just 100 novice and 100 experienced EFL teachers. Third, the qualitative nature of the study limits the generalizability of its findings. Therefore, replication of the study with the participation of all Iranian EFL teachers and controlling gender, age, and academic degree may bring forward different results. Further, a replicated quantitative study may delve into more precise findings.

Acknowledgments

We would like to thank all the officials of the Educational Groups of Alborz Province Education Office who permitted the supervisors to implement this research project. We also wish to deeply appreciate all the supervisors and teacher trainers who helped us to administer this new model of teacher supervision as well as, we kindly gratitude all the teachers who participated in this program voluntarily.

References

- Amini, S., & Gholami, J. (2018). Professional development of EFL teachers through rotatory peer supervision. *Journal of Teacher Education for Sustainability*, 20(2), 101-117.
- Arong, F. E., & Ogbandu, M. A. (2010). Major causes of declining quality of education in Nigeria administrative perspective: A case study of dekina local government area. *Canadian Social Science*, 6(3), 61-76.
- Azizpour, Sh., & Gholami, J. (2021b). EFL teacher-supervisors' attitudes toward supervision in Iranian language schools. *Iranian Journal of English for Academic Purposes*, 10(1), 16-34.
- Azizpour, Sh., & Gholami, J. (2021c). Exploring EFL teachers' attitudes toward teacher supervision in Iranian language schools. *Journal of Applied Linguistics and Applied Literature: Dynamics and Advances*, 9(2), 105-125.
- Azizpour, Sh., & Gholami, J. (2021a). Iranian language school managers' attitudes towards EFL teacher supervision. *International Journal of Foreign Language Teaching & Research*, 9(35), 53-69.
- Baniabdelrahman, A. A. (2004). Roles of cooperating teachers and practicum supervisors and their effect on EFL student-teachers' teaching skills. *Asian EFL Journal*, 6(3), Article 8. http://www.asian-efl-journal.com/september_04_aab.php
- Brandon, J., Hollweck, T., Donlevy, J. K., & Whalen, C. (2018). Teacher supervision and evaluation challenges: Canadian perspectives on overall instructional leadership. *Teachers and Teaching*, 24(3), 263-280.
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3, 77-101.
- Chen, C. W. Y., & Cheng, Y. S. (2013). The supervisory process of EFL teachers: A case study. *TESL-EJ*, 17(1), 1-21.

- Danielson, C., & McGreal, T. L. (2000). *Teacher evaluation to enhance professional practice*. Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.
- Diacopoulos, M. M., & Butler, B. M. (2020). What do we supervise for? A self-study of learning teacher candidate supervision. *Studying Teacher Education, 16*(1), 66-83.
- Earle, F., Fox, J., Webb, C., & Bowyer, S. (2017). Reflective supervision: Resource pack. *Dartington: Research in Practice*.
- Eryilmaz, A., & Mutlu, T. (2017). Developing the four-stage supervision model for counselor trainees. *Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice, 17*, 597-629.
- Esia-Donkoh, K., & Ofosu-Dwamena, E. (2014). Effects of educational supervision on professional development: perception of public basic school teachers at Winneba, Ghana. *British Journal of Education, 26*(6), 63-82. www.eajournals.org
- Estaji, M., & Ghiasvand, F. (2022). Classroom supervision and professionalism: Matches and mismatches in the perceptions of novice and experienced teachers. *Applied Research on English Language, 11*(3), 1-36. DOI: 10.22108/ARE.2022.131707.1817
- Ghoshooni, A. (1995). *The survey in quality of training courses in-services at high schools in Tehran*. Unpublished Master's Thesis in Persian, Tarbiyat Moallem University.
- Glickman, C., Gordon, S., & Ross-Gordon, J. (2008). *The basic guide to supervision and instructional leadership*. Allyn & Bacon.
- Hoque, K. E., Kenayathulla, H. B. B., Subramaniam, M. V. D/O., & Islam, R. (2020). Relationships between supervision and teachers' performance and attitude in secondary schools in Malaysia. *SAGE OPEN, 1*-11. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244020925501>
- Jaeger, E. L. (2013). Teacher reflection: Supports, barriers, and results. *Issues in Teacher Education, 22*(1), 89-104.
- Janssens, F. J., & Van Amelsvoort, G. H. (2008). School self-evaluations and school inspections in Europe: An exploratory study. *Studies in Educational Evaluation, 34*(1), 15-23.
- Khany, R., & Azimi Amoli, F. (2016). Validating an English language teacher professional development scale in Iranian EFL Context. *Issues in Language Teaching (ILT), 5*(1), 107-134.
- Khany, R., & Azimi Amoli, F. (2016). *Evaluation of English language teacher professional development in an Iranian EFL context: Towards the development of a new inventory*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation in English, Ilam University.
- Mette, I., Aguilar, I., & Wieczorek, D. (2020). A thirty-state analysis of teacher supervision and evaluation systems in the ESSA era. *Journal of Educational Supervision, 3*(2), 105-135.
- Moradi, K., Sepehrfar, S., & Khadiv, T. P. (2014). Exploring Iranian EFL teachers' perceptions on supervision. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences, 98*, 1214-1223.
- Morrison, T. (2005). *Staff supervision in social care*. Brighton: Pavilion.
- Nolan, J., & Hoover, L. A. (2007). *Teacher supervision and evaluation: Theory into practice*. Wiley. <https://books.google.com/books?id=zRlbAAAACAAJ>
- Pawlas, G. E., & Oliva, P. F. (2007). *Supervision for today's schools*. Wiley. <https://books.google.com/books?id=5VdyDwAAQBAJ>
- Rahmany, R., Hasani, M. T., & Parhoodeh, K. (2014). EFL teachers' attitudes towards being supervised in an EFL context. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research, 5*(2), 348-359. <https://doi.org/10.4304/jltr.5.2.348-359>
- Sergiovanni, T. J., & Starratt, R. J. (2007). *Supervision: A redefinition*. New York, NY: McGraw-Hill.
- Teddle, C., Stringfield, S., & Burdett, J. (2003). International comparisons of the relationships among educational effectiveness, evaluation, and improvement variables: An overview. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education, 17*(1), 5-20.
- Zeichner, K. m., & Liston, D. P. (1987). Teaching student teachers to reflect. *Harvard Educational Review, 56*(1), 23-48.
- Zepeda, S. J., & Ponticell, J. A. (1998). At cross-purposes: What do teachers need, want, and get from supervision? *Journal of Curriculum and Supervision, 14*(1), 68-87.