

Towards a Scale for Developing EFL Materials based on the Principles of Critical Pedagogy

Elham Tabatabaei

Ph.D. candidate of TEFL
Department of Foreign Languages
Shiraz Branch, Islamic Azad University
Shiraz, Iran
Email: e.tabataba91@yahoo.com

Mohammad Bavali*

Assistant Professor of TEFL
Department of Foreign Languages
Shiraz Branch, Islamic Azad University
Shiraz, Iran
Email: Mbvl57@gmail.com

Leila Akbarpour

Assistant Professor of TEFL
Department of Foreign Languages
Shiraz Branch, Islamic Azad University
Shiraz, Iran
Email: akbarpourleila@gmail.com

Abstract. This study aimed at designing a scale for developing EFL materials based on the principles of Critical Pedagogy. In so doing, a qualitative thematic analysis method was used. The participants of this study consisted of 20 (10 males and 10 females) EFL experts with more than 15 years of teaching EFL at the university level with at least one published paper on critical pedagogy and materials development, who were selected through purposive sampling from different states and Azad universities in Iran. To collect the data, a semi-structured interview was implemented. The existing literature on critical pedagogy and different materials development models was reviewed so that through merging

Received: October 2022; Accepted: January 2023

*Corresponding author

the interview and literature review data, the recurrent categories can be identified and converted into the items of the intended scale. To analyze the data, thematic analysis was used. The following main themes were revealed as the main themes for CP-based EFL materials development: Defining CP-based objectives, developing CP-based content, encouraging CP-based teaching methods, encouraging CP-based evaluation procedures, and defining CP-based roles for teachers and students. Based on the extracted themes, a scale was developed into six categories. The developed scale consisted of 50 items in a five-point Likert range from 1=strongly disagree to 5=strongly agree. The findings have some implications for EFL teachers, learners, curriculum planners, and researchers.

Keywords: CP-based materials development scale; critical pedagogy (CP); EFL materials; materials development

1. Introduction

Among different kinds of educational materials with a variety of orientations, a critical pedagogy-based material which is the main concern of the present study can be defined as any type of educational materials which are built upon critical pedagogy. Such materials aim at educating all students regardless of their culture, ethnicity, color, religion, and class (Lie, 2016). Some dimensions of critical pedagogy-based educational curricula, as introduced in the existing literature, include linguistic diversity, intercultural awareness, lack of discrimination and prejudice in education, and equal opportunities for education for all groups of students from different cultures, races, colors, and social classes (Zohrabi, et al., 2019).

It can be argued that critical pedagogy is not without its impact on policy and practice of curriculum reforms. The argument is that a critical pedagogy-based approach creates dynamic conditions by integrating elements of different thinking lines, and presenting a human lifestyle in which the past, future, and present are connected. Indeed, from the outset of the 21st century, these views have penetrated different aspects of ELT including the basis of curricula, curriculum content, curriculum administration, and curriculum evaluation (Wei, 2018). If critical pedagogy-based transformations in ELT can be supposed as one of the ideal ways to educational problems, it seems that constructing a critical

pedagogy-oriented scale for materials development leads to positive and constructive changes in the current ELT system of Iran.

Contrary to the argument that critical pedagogy-based approaches to education in general and language learning, in particular, provide transformative and useful responses to new educational needs, necessities, and problems of EFL learners and teachers in a multicultural and pluralistic global World, the educational system of Iran, specifically in the realm of EFL learning, has not been so responsive to critical pedagogy-based transformation. As evidence of this saying, Zohrabi, et al. (2019) referred to the dominance of a static system of EFL learning in Iran, in which predetermined English textbooks are taught which are devoid of heavy attention to teachers' and learners' voices, roles, participation, and contributions to education. In such a system, the diverse learning needs of learners in today's global World have been neglected.

Despite the above scenario, it has been explicitly stated that critical pedagogy principles should be applied to syllabi and curricula in Iran if stakeholders seek to make sure that the educational system is in line with the most recent developments socially, culturally, and politically. To this end, ELT stakeholders should seek to incorporate critical pedagogy principles in EFL educational programs so that they can prepare EFL learners for living in today's global village, in line with World education orientation (Sadeghi, 2010). This necessity is felt in Iran as a country wherein there are EFL learners with diverse needs, wants, and cultures, different languages, dialects, accents, customs, and worldviews. Considering this fact, the researchers decided to develop a scale for developing EFL materials based on the principles of critical pedagogy. To this end, the following research questions were formulated:

RQ1. What are the main themes extracted for CP-based EFL materials development according to experts' views and existing literature??

RQ2. What scale can be developed for developing EFL materials based on the tenets of critical pedagogy?

2. Literature Review

2.1 Theoretical framework

This study was theoretically built upon Tomlinson's (2011) materials

development framework and critical pedagogy (CP) principles. In Tomlinson's (2011) materials development framework:

- . Materials should be influential.
- . Materials should help learners feel comfortable.
- . Materials should improve learners' self-confidence.
- . Learners should perceive materials as relevant and useful.
- . Materials should improve learners' self-direction.
- . Learners must be ready to learn materials.
- . Materials should be authentic.
- . Materials should expose learners to the relevant input.
- . Materials should target increasing learners' communication ability.
- . Materials should target both short-term and long-term learning.
- . Materials should be adapted to learners' learning styles.
- . Materials should be adapted to learners' affective attitudes.
- . Materials should include a silent time interval at the outset of instruction.
- . Materials should involve both right- and left-brain activities.
- . Materials should not put over-emphasis on the controlled practice.
- . Materials should involve feedback (pp. 8-12).

Concerning CP, When Freire (1993) developed critical pedagogy for the first time, critical pedagogy has been introduced as a praxis-oriented educational movement, under the leadership of passion and principle, to help students acquire freedom awareness, be informed of authoritarian tendencies, and relate knowledge to power (Giroux, 2010).

Thus, critical pedagogy is a philosophy of education whose agenda is a change to eliminate oppression and suffering (Brosio, 2000) by removing social inequities to empower and transform others and making decisions based on morals and values (Capper, 1993). In sum, critical theorists, in the realm of education, are willing to move toward positive social change to build a democratic and socially just society (White, Cooper, & Mackey, 2014).

Freire (1970), the leading philosopher in critical pedagogy, distinguished traditional banking and problem-posing model of education. The former implies a system of education where the teacher acts as the holder of knowledge and deposits that knowledge into the brains of passive learners. He calls the latter an act of cognition, not a transfer of information. This so-called act of cognition is realized through critical dialogues. For this process to be meaningful, the learners themselves should pose the problems based on their interests, while the opposite is the case in banking education.

Freire (1993), also dealt with the notion of literacy. He believed that illiteracy is not only concerned with the lack of the skills of reading and writing, but also with the feeling of powerlessness and dependency. He believed that literacy education is a primary form of cultural action and must link speaking to reality transformation. From his standpoint, besides reforming the thoughts, the habits, the institutions, ideologies, and relations that create oppressed thinking also must be transformed. Along the same line, Giroux (1983) makes a distinction between the language of critique and the language of possibility. To him, the fault of the critics of the new education sociology is that they just offered a language of critique and regarded schools as instruments for the representation of capitalist relations and legitimation of dominant ideologies. To Giroux (1994), "Critical pedagogy signals how questions of audience, voice, power, and evaluation actively work to construct particular relations between teachers and students, institutions and society, classrooms and communities" (p.30).

According to Darder (1991, p.77), "a critical pedagogy must seriously address the concept of cultural politics by both legitimizing and challenging cultural experiences that comprise the histories and social realities that in turn comprise the forms and boundaries that give meaning to student lives."

2.2 Related studies

Even though the principles of Critical Pedagogy have been defined and elaborated for many stakeholders in educational policy, only a few research studies conducted on the principles of CP into practice.

To explore the impact of critical pedagogy on the critical thinking ability of EFL learners in the process of English essay writing teaching, Rafi (2010) conducted a research study. It was unraveled that critical pedagogy-based English essay writing teaching contributed to higher critical thinking among the participants through the mediating role of enhanced reasoning skills.

Sadeghi (2010) did a qualitative study to show the elements of critical education in the National Curriculum of Iran. The findings from document analysis showed that although assessment procedures, statement of objectives, descriptions of courses, and some other parts reflect critical principles to some extent, strategies of teaching and learning do not cover such elements.

Barjesteh, et al. (2013) sought to see whether critical pedagogy strategies can positively influence EFL learners' reading comprehension ability. To this end, a quasi-experimental study was conducted wherein while one group benefited from critical pedagogy strategies, the other group was deprived of it. The findings confirmed significant effectiveness of critical pedagogy strategies on subjects' reading comprehension.

In a correlational study, Jorshari and Akbari (2013) investigated the interplay between the attitude of EFL learners toward critical pedagogy and their academic achievement in writing skills. The results showed that critical pedagogy and learners' academic success in writing were significantly correlated.

Pishvaei and Kasaian (2013) tried to design a questionnaire to measure attitudes towards critical pedagogy in the context of Iran. To validate the developed scale, it was distributed among and filled by 100 English teachers teaching at institutes and universities in Iran. It was recognized that the developed scale is of high reliability and validity.

Similarly, Shabani (2014) touched on the interplay between EFL teachers' attitudes towards the principle of critical pedagogy and their teaching success. The findings of the study showed that teachers who had more positive attitudes toward the principle of critical pedagogy were more successful in their teaching.

Mahmoudi et al. (2014) did a study to investigate the utility of critical pedagogy in curriculum development. It was argued that un-

der the influence of critical pedagogy, a new teaching and education approach has emerged, with an emphasis on critical thinking for eliminating inequality and injustice. To them, an educational program should be developed to transform the educational system, based on the principles of critical pedagogy. The researchers reviewed critical pedagogy, its premises, as well as some principles which can be taken into account in developing a critical pedagogy-based curriculum. The followings were enumerated as the main principles of critical pedagogy: Taking traditional and indigenous social contexts into account, involving instructors and students in planning educational programs, putting emphasis on the political stance of education in curriculum development, taking into consideration the place of cultural notions in curriculum planning, and the association between curriculum planning and economic productivity.

White et al. (2014) considered two educational strategies within critical pedagogy which can empower students by paying attention to their needs. This was conducted in an attempt to remove the effects of dominance, power, and majority group membership education of people in post-colonial world. In this path, the researchers benefited from the principles of multicultural education and critical pedagogy so that an eclectic education is developed wherein the needs of diverse groups are taken into consideration. They proposed the simultaneous use of multicultural education and critical pedagogy with different and complementary potentials to empower students to live successfully and happily in today's world with fast changes and transformations.

Larson (2014) investigated the theoretical bases and justifications for the employment of critical pedagogy in Indonesia. To this end, the researcher first described critical pedagogy. Then, he provided a rationale for using critical pedagogy in Indonesia by reviewing the relevant studies. Finally, some preliminary steps were proposed for teachers to follow in implementing critical pedagogy in English language teaching.

Rahimi et al. (2015) proposed some ideas for material designers based on the premises of critical pedagogy. This was done with the help of reviewing the extant literature on critical pedagogy. The proposed ideas were applicable to the selection and gradation phase of material design in accordance with the critical pedagogy principles. The main

concepts upon which the study was built included problem posing, generative themes, and concentric circles concepts. Moreover, immediacy and comparison concepts were suggested as useful tools for the selection and gradation of the content of critical materials.

Taylor et al. (2015) investigated pre-service teachers about their perception of critical education and teaching of culturally and linguistically underrepresented diverse students. Participants completed a modified version of the diversity orientation survey. First, the results showed that the majority of pre-service teachers largely agreed on the need for the inclusion of critical education in teacher education programs. Second, participants indicated a lack of awareness in critical education in terms of cultural awareness in the teaching of special needs. This paper conceptualized pre-service teachers' perceptions towards education in general and discussed the teaching of culturally and linguistically underrepresented diverse learners. The authors proposed reforms in the curriculum of teacher education preparation programs in colleges of education to the inclusion of comprehensive critical education courses at each level of education.

Roohani et al. (2016) developed and validated a questionnaire, namely Teacher Critical Pedagogy, to measure the amount of critical pedagogy employed in the classroom by English teachers in Iran. The scale consisted of six sub-scales. Cronbach's alpha reliability of the scale was found to be high. Also, the validity of the questionnaire was measured through the maximum likelihood estimation (MLE) technique using Analysis of Moment Structures (AMOS) software.

Childs (2017) investigated the history of critical education in the USA. This study was an attempt to explore viewpoints and positions which can contribute to the formation of critical curricula in the future. This study discussed the need to uncover the role of multiculturalism in the classroom by recognizing the need to go beyond surface approaches to intercultural teaching. It was concluded that since the demographics of students are subjected to inevitable shifts, critical ideas should be integrated into such areas as planning future curricula, teacher education, etc.

Enyew and Melesse (2018) examined the extent to which the is-

sue of critical principles is infused into the environments of Universities in Ethiopia. By random sampling, four hundred forty-four instructors and students were selected from five universities. A structured questionnaire and an unstructured interview were used as data collection instruments. The quantitative data were analyzed using a one-sample t-test whereas the qualitative one was analyzed using narration. The quantitative data disclosed that the issue of criticality is infused into the programs of the Universities, whereas the qualitative one did not.

Wei (2018) addressed how postmodernism was introduced in curriculum shifts since the outset of the 21st century in China. It was discussed that within 15 years, in reaction to the fast economic development and the pressures of exam-based teaching, the government introduced a post-modernistic curriculum framework beyond the limits of modernistic curriculum development. However, the shifts are slow due to inertia culture and the absence of micro-culture in the classroom, which contributed to the dissociation between policy-making and implementation practices.

Parker (2019) addressed the values of multicultural education for ELT and teacher education in post-secondary education. To this end, different aspects of critical multicultural education were explored as guiding forces for EFL learners in comprehending the content of courses. It was recommended that stakeholders take these elements as starting points for re-conceptualizing their teaching principles and methods.

As found by the researchers in reviewing the literature, although some studies in the context of Iran (e.g., Abdollahzadeh, & Haddad Narafshan, 2016; Adel & Sadeghi, 2019; Akbarpour & Sahragard, 2016; Aliakbari, & Allahmoradi, 2012; Aliakbari, & Azimi Amoli, 2014; Aliakbari & Sadeghdaghighi, 2013; Alvandi, et al., 2015; Birjandi & Bagherkazemi, 2010; Davari, et al., 2012; Shangarffam & Rahnama Roud Poshti, 2011) have addressed critical pedagogy from different viewpoints, no critical pedagogy-based scale has been developed for material development in EFL context of Iran. The previous studies have touched on critical pedagogy principles mostly at the theoretical level (Sadeghi & Adel, 2019). More specifically, there are few studies (if any) on practical and applied considerations of critical pedagogy in the EFL context of Iran. In this research paucity, to bridge this gap, the researchers decided to develop

a scale for developing EFL materials based on the principles of critical pedagogy.

3. Method

3.1 Design

In line with the objectives of the present study, a qualitative thematic analysis method was used. This method is appropriate for extracting the recurrent themes and patterns in the data.

3.2 Participants

The participants recruited for this study consisted of 20 (10 males and 10 females) EFL experts with more than 15 years of teaching EFL at the university level with at least one published paper on critical pedagogy and materials development. The experts were selected through purposive sampling from different states and Azad universities in Iran, including Shiraz Azad University, Shiraz State University, University of Tehran, and Isfahan University through purposive sampling. They were Ph.D. holders, in the 45-60 range of age.

This group was interviewed to extract the main themes for CP-based EFL materials development. Data saturation (the point where no new information was obtained) was achieved through interviewing this sample size. To observe research ethics, the participants' consent was taken for participation in the present study. Moreover, the anonymity and confidentiality of their personal information were ensured.

3.3 Instruments

3.3.1 Semi-structured interview

A semi-structured interview was conducted to extract the main themes for CP-based EFL materials development. This interview was designed by referring to similar studies and consulting the supervisor and advisor of the study. The interview contained 12 open-ended questions addressing critical pedagogy-based EFL materials development. The language of the interview was English and no time limitation was assigned to it. The researcher herself conducted the audio-recorded interviews on WhatsApp and Telegram due to observing sanitary protocols imposed

because of the Covid-19 pandemic. To establish the dependability and credibility of the interview data, low-inference descriptors and member checks were used.

3.4 Procedure

To collect the required data, through reviewing the existing literature on critical pedagogy and different materials development models in general, and Tomlinson's (2011) model in particular, the principles of critical pedagogy as well as materials development scales were investigated to identify the main themes for CP-based EFL materials development. Moreover, for the same purpose, 20 (males and females) EFL experts with more than 15 years of teaching EFL at the university level with at least one published paper on critical pedagogy and materials development were interviewed. To extract the recurrent themes, interview and literature review data were qualitatively analyzed through thematic analysis. Finally, the extracted categories were integrated to form a scale for CP-based EFL materials development.

4. Results

Through thematic analysis of the data, the following categories were identified along with some sub-categories: Defining CP-based objectives, developing CP-based content, encouraging CP-based teaching methods, encouraging CP-based evaluation procedures, defining CP-based roles for teachers, and defining CP-based roles for students. These categories are explained as follows:

4.1 Defining CP-based objectives

The first category extracted was defining CP-based objectives. According to this category, in developing EFL materials based on critical pedagogy, first, some objectives should be defined based on CP. This category consisted of some sub-categories which are presented as follows:

Creating equal opportunities for all students to develop their fullest potential

The meaning of this sub-category is creating equal opportunities for all students to develop their fullest potential, regardless of ethnicity, color,

religion, gender, and social class. This means that all students should be provided with equal opportunities in education. As mentioned in the following quotation:

All students with different cultures, religions, genders, and social classes should have the right to develop academically and cognitively. Discrimination should be removed from educational settings.

Promoting individual and group self-esteem and identity

According to this sub-category, the goal of developing EFL materials should be generating a feeling of confidence and pride in students toward their own identities. They should also be taught to respect others' identities. As it is clear in the following quotation:

The students should be encouraged and taught to know that each person's identity is important. At the same time, they should be taught to respect the other students' identities.

Encouraging critical thinking

As implied by this sub-category, EFL materials development should seek to foster the critical thinking of the students. The following quotation shows this viewpoint:

Students should be trained to think critically. They should also be trained to criticize the current social, political, and educational systems and provide solutions to the problems.

Promoting fair distribution of power in the educational settings

As stated by this sub-category, an objective of EFL materials development should be a fair distribution of power in educational settings. As mentioned in the following quotation:

That is, through fair distribution of power in schools, institutes, classrooms, and different educational settings, students learn that all groups of people in society have the voices to be heard by teachers and administrators. From another angle, power should be in the hands of different groups including teachers, students, administrators, etc.

Enhancing full personal development

This sub-category means that EFL materials development should seek to enhance the personal development of different involved groups including students, teachers, administrators, etc. This growth should be in its full affective and cognitive forms. This is evident in the following saying:

The objective of materials should not be limited to the promotion of academic development of the students, but education should help all groups including teachers, students, and managers grow personally in cognitive and affective aspects.

Creating classes wherein all voices, experiences, and thinking lines are equally heard

EFL materials development should be done in educational settings in such a way that all voices, experiences, and thinking lines of teachers and students be equally heard. In other words, in education, voices, experiences, and thinking lines of all students and teachers from different cultures, ethnicities, social classes, etc. should be considered. The following quotation shows this perspective:

Novice and experienced teachers' experiences, strong and weak students' experiences, and low- and high-class students' voices should be equally heard in the schools and classrooms. Education should seek to provide opportunities for materialization of this matter.

Teaching students to learning how to respond to cultural and social differences

EFL materials development should be done in a way that students are taught to learn how to react properly to cultural and social differences. According to the following quotation:

Students should learn that within the same society, environment, or class, there are different social classes and cultures which might not be similar to their own culture and social class. Therefore, they should know how to tolerate cultural and social conflicts and differences.

Encouraging human relations that emphasize diverse people living together harmoniously

It is of much significance for EFL materials development to encourage

students to learn about human relations, so that they can live in a heterogeneous society harmoniously and avoid conflicts. In the following quotation, this belief is clear:

Students should be taught to learn about human relations based on peace. They should learn that peace and compatibility among different cultures are the best things for human relations in educational settings and beyond them.

Reducing prejudice and discrimination among students

In EFL materials development, much emphasis should be put on reducing prejudice, by providing all groups of students with equal learning opportunities and social justice. This is illustrated in the following quotation:

Materials should seek to remove prejudice and discrimination among students with different backgrounds in terms of social class, culture, religion, talent, and so on. Inequity should not exert negative effects on students' academic achievements.

Changing the structure of educational settings

According to this sub-category, EFL materials development should aim at changing the structure of educational environments so that male and female students, exceptional students, and students who are members of different social, religious, and cultural groups have an equal chance to achieve academically. This is obvious in the following quotation:

The total structure of educational settings should be re-constructed. An environment should be created wherein the improvement and learning of all groups of students are welcomed. There should be no discriminatory orientation toward the superiority of higher social, economic or cultural groups. No culture should be dominant over other cultures.

Establishing balance and equity

This sub-category says that EFL materials development should establish balance and equity in educational settings. That is, the objective of education should be avoiding marginalization and establishing equity and social justice in the educational settings and classrooms so that a

particular group of students does not feel that they are dominated by some other students with a particular ethnicity, language, and culture. In the following quotation, this view is apparent:

EFL materials should generate a context wherein all students belonging to different groups have the same rights. No teacher should be allowed to be biased toward a specific class or culture.

Improving and developing democratic attitudes and values

The goal of EFL materials development should be encouraging democratic stances including attitudes and values through anti-discrimination and anti-prejudice teachings. As argued in the following quotation:

Either implicitly or explicitly, teachers should raise the learners' awareness about the negative consequences of discrimination and prejudice and teach the students about the values of democracy.

4.2 Developing CP-based content

The second extracted category is called content which consists of 24 sub-categories as presented in Table 1.

4.3 Encouraging CP-based teaching methods

The third extracted category was coded as diverse, participatory, and negotiation-based teaching methods. This category consists of four sub-categories which are explained as follows.

Using diverse teaching methods and techniques

As argued by the experts and in the existing literature and documents, instead of limiting themselves to a specific teaching method and technique, teachers should take advantage of different teaching methods and techniques. In this way, students are not limited to some fixed and prevalent learning methods, but they can learn the materials in different ways. This is evident in the following quotation:

Teachers should implement various teaching methods. In this way, different students with different and idiosyncratic learning styles can be exposed to different types of instructions and can learn the learning materials better.

Table 1: CP-based content

1-	The content should generate fundamental shifts in the educational setting.
2-	The content should be reflective of the voices of various cultures, without belittling a specific culture or making a specific culture dominant.
3-	The content should indicate different religions and ethnicities.
4-	The content should be reflective of both English and Persian cultural elements.
5-	The content should aim at building a multi-cultural identity in students.
6-	The content should not support the hegemony of English or Persian language.
7-	The content should aim at increasing students' knowledge of histories, worldviews, wills, and wants of both minor and major nations.
8-	The content should be jointly built by negotiation with minor and major groups of curriculum planners, students, and teachers.
9-	The content should generate a climate of knowledge building, prejudice removal, and equity education.
10-	The content should cover matters such as personal, and citizen rights, democratic principles, personal and social identities, and local and global attitudes.
11-	The content should aim at making learners creative thinkers.
12-	The content should aim at making learners critical thinkers.
13-	The content should enhance learners' communicative and interactive skills.
14-	The content should call for different teaching methods.
15-	The content should cover various aspects of life including educational, social, political, economic, and cultural aspects.
16-	The content should not be biased against or toward a specific language, religion, and culture.
17-	The content should not encourage hegemony.
18-	The content should aim at raising students' consciousness in different dimensions such as political, ideological, and social aspects
19-	The content should invite learners to discuss and negotiate meaning.
20-	The content should cover the needs and interests of different groups of learners from different social and cultural classes.
21-	The content should change learners' viewpoints to make them social critics.
22-	The content should raise learners' attention toward social problems.
23-	The content should equip learners with the necessary transformative views so that they can question and challenge the status quo
24-	The content should empower learners to challenge different forms of oppression.

Using participatory teaching methods

As argued by the experts and in the existing literature and documents, teaching methods should be developed based on the views of different stakeholder groups including students, teachers, and curriculum planners from different cultural, ethnic, and social class groups. The following quotation shows this theme:

All involved groups should be engaged in designing teaching methods. This leads to the development of participatory methods of teaching which are richer than teaching methods designed exclusively just by teachers.

Using negotiation-based teaching methods

By the experts and in the existing literature and documents, it was also argued that teaching methods should be negotiation-based. That is, teachers should not apply teaching methods that have been planned and selected out of negotiation and consultation with their students and colleagues. This theme is evident in the following saying:

Teaching methods should not be selected based on the personal preferences of teachers. But teachers are recommended to take views of students and counterparts into account in choosing teaching methods, by negotiating them.

Using eclectic teaching methods

As argued by the experts and in the literature, teaching methods should be eclectic. This implies that teachers should integrate different teaching methods to reach richer and more effective teaching methods. The following quotation shows this viewpoint:

Teaching methods should be generated by combining the strong aspects of different teaching methods. Using a particular teaching method is not likely to contribute to productive and useful learning and achievement outcomes.

4.4 Encouraging CP-based evaluation procedures

Encouraging CP-based evaluation procedures was the next extracted category. Four subcategories were extracted for this category as follows:

Using mixed evaluation procedures through quantitative and

qualitative methods

According to the experts and literature and documents, quantitative and qualitative evaluation methods of evaluation should be combined to have mixed evaluation methods. This is clearly seen in the following quotation:

If both quantitative methods including multiple-choice tests and open-ended exams and qualitative methods including interviews and biography writing are simultaneously used, learners' learning is more efficiently assessed.

Using dynamic evaluation methods

According to this sub-category, to evaluate students' knowledge, teachers should go beyond traditional evaluation methods and incorporate more flexible methods including interpretive methods. This can be seen in the following quotation:

Teachers should not rely just on the psychometric measures of students. They should also pay heed to so other elements including students' background level, their socio-cultural history, etc. In this way, a better assessment of students' knowledge is done.

Using cooperative evaluation methods

According to this sub-category, all the stakeholders should be involved in designing the evaluation methods. Teachers', learners', and even parents' voices should be heard in developing evaluation methods. This is illustrated by the following quotation:

In the evaluation of learners, different parties should have cooperation. This makes democratic evaluation possible. The time has reached for the arrival of the voice of different groups including examinees, examiners, parents, etc. in assessment procedures.

Using diverse evaluation methods

This sub-category says that in the evaluation of students' knowledge, diverse methods should be used. That is, self-assessment, peer assessment, summative assessment, formative assessment, and a variety of other methods of evaluation should be used. The following quotation

shows this theme:

To me, different types of tests and exams including formative and summative tests, self-reports of students, dynamic tests, traditional tests, etc. should be used to evaluate students more accurately. Just taking one or two test forms cannot indicate the real level or knowledge of students.

4.5 Defining CP-based roles for teachers

Defining CP-based roles for teachers was another category extracted from the data. This category consists of some sub-categories which are explained in this section.

Teachers are learning process facilitators.

This sub-category says that EFL materials should be developed so that teachers are considered as taking a facilitating role in the process of learning. The following quotation shows this:

Teachers should not be taken as providers of learning materials. They should not be assumed as controllers. But they should be defined as facilitators that help students learn better and more easily.

Teachers are coordinators in learning process.

Based on this sub-category, in developing EFL materials, the role considered for teachers should be learning process coordinators. That is, their role is shifted from controllers of learning process to coordinators of learning process. This is evident in the following saying:

When developing EFL materials, teachers should be assumed as taking the role of coordinators. The time of assigning a full-agency role to teachers is over in CP-based materials development.

Teachers should make learners aware of hidden ideology and power in EFL materials.

As implied by this sub-category, EFL materials are intermingled with an ideology and power which should be made explicit by teachers. The following quotation is reflective of this view:

EFL materials are not neutral, but they are ideology- and power-laden. Teachers must unravel these hidden aspects of EFL materials for learners.

4.6 Defining CP-based roles for students

The last category which was identified from the data was that in developing EFL materials, a CP-based role should be defined for students. The sub-categories of this category are as follows:

Students are active decision-makers

This sub-category means that in developing EFL materials, students should be considered as active decision-makers in the learning process. They are not mere receivers of knowledge and instruction from teachers. The following quotation is reflective of this viewpoint:

I believe that students should not be supposed as passive beings in the classroom who just receive the materials from their teacher and memorize them. But they are active players in the game of learning and their decisions and plans are of significance in the learning process.

Students should have active participation in EFL materials development

This sub-category says that students should participate actively in EFL materials development. This means that the role of students is changed from a passive one to an active one. The following quotation shows this belief:

My ideology is that students should participate in developing EFL materials. They should be consulted and their ideas should be used in materials development. The important role of students should not be missed in developing EFL materials.

Students should participate in the assessment of their performance

According to this sub-category, when assessing students' performance, teachers should count on students' participation. That is, teachers should not be the sole authority and resource in the assessment of students' performance. The following quotation illustrates this:

Students can help teachers reach a better indicator of their performance. Some information from students can be really helpful in better evaluation of their knowledge. Thus, teachers are recommended to take advantage of

students by calling for their self-reports, self-assessment or assessment, and so on.

4.7 The proposed scale

Through integrating the above categories and sub-categories, the following scale was developed for CP-based EFL materials development: As is seen in Table 2, the developed scale in total consists of six sub-categories, each with some sub-categories. On the whole, the developed scale consists of 50 items to which the respondents should answer in a five-point Likert range from 1=strongly disagree to 5=strongly agree. Validating this scale is postponed to another study by the same authors.

Table 2: The Developed Scale for CP-based EFL Materials Development

Categories	Sub-categories	Strongly disagree =1	Disagree =2	Neutral =3	Agree =4	Strongly agree=5
Defining CP-based objectives	1. Creating equal opportunities for all students to develop their fullest potential.					
	2. Promoting individual and group self-esteem and identity.					
	3. Encouraging critical thinking in students.					
	4. Promoting fair distribution of power in educational settings.					
	5. Enhancing full personal development.					
	6. Creating classes wherein all voices, experiences, and thinking lines are equally heard.					
	7. Teaching students to learning how to respond to cultural and social differences.					
	8. Encouraging human relations that emphasize diverse people living together harmoniously.					

	9. Reducing prejudice and discrimination among students.					
	10. Making shifts in the structure of educational environments.					
	11. Generating justice and equity.					
	12. Improving and developing democratic attitudes and values.					
Developing CP-based content	1. The content should generate fundamental shifts in the total educational setting.					
	2. The content should be reflective of voices of various cultures, without belittling a specific culture or making a specific culture dominant.					
	3. The content should indicate different religions and ethnicities.					
	4. The content should be reflective of both English and Persian cultural elements.					
	5. The content should aim at building a multi-cultural identity in students.					
	6. The content should not support the hegemony of English or Persian language.					
	7. The content should aim at increasing students' knowledge of histories, worldviews, wills, and wants of both minor and major nations.					
	8. The content should be jointly built by negotiation with minor and major groups of curriculum planners, students, and teachers.					

	9. The content should generate a climate of knowledge building, prejudice removal, and equity education.					
	10. The content should cover matters such as personal, and citizen rights, democratic principles, personal and social identities, and local and global attitudes.					
	11. The content should aim at making learners creative thinkers.					
	12. The content should aim at making learners critical thinkers.					
	13. The content should enhance learners' communicative and interactive skills.					
	14. The content should call for different teaching methods.					
	15. The content should cover various aspects of life including					
	educational, social, political, economic, and cultural aspects.					
	16. The content should not be biased against or toward a specific language, religion, and culture.					
	17. The content should not encourage hegemony.					
	18. The content should aim at raising students' consciousness in different dimensions such as political, ideological, and social aspects.					
	19. The content should invite learners to discussion and negotiation of meaning.					

	20. The content should cover the needs and interests of different groups of learners from different social and cultural classes.					
	21. The content should intend to change learners' viewpoints to make them social critics.					
	22. The content should raise learners' attention toward social problems.					
	23. The content should equip learners with the necessary transformative views so that they can question and challenge the status quo.					
	24. The content should empower learners to challenge different forms of oppression.					
Encouraging CP-based teaching methods	1. Using diverse teaching methods and techniques.					
	2. Using participatory teaching methods.					
	3. Using negotiation-based teaching methods.					
	4. Using eclectic teaching methods.					
Encouraging CP-based evaluation procedures	1. Using mixed evaluation procedures through quantitative and qualitative methods.					
	2. Using dynamic evaluation methods.					
	3. Using cooperative evaluation methods.					
	4. Using diverse evaluation methods					
Defining CP-based roles for teachers	1. Teachers are learning process facilitators.					
	2. Teachers are coordinators in learning process.					
	3. Teachers should make learners aware of hidden ideology and power in EFL materials.					
Defining CP-based roles for students	1. Students are active decision-makers.					
	2. Students should have active participation in EFL materials development.					
	3. Students should participate in the assessment of their performance.					

5. Discussion

The present study sought to answer two main research questions. In this section, the findings related to each question are discussed and interpreted. Regarding the first research question ‘What are the main themes extracted for CP-based EFL materials development according to experts’ views and existing literature?’, the following main themes were revealed: Defining CP-based objectives, developing CP-based content, encouraging CP-based teaching methods, encouraging CP-based evaluation procedures, defining CP-based roles for teachers, and defining CP-based roles for students. However, these themes were also associated with some sub-themes which were explained in the previous sections.

Concerning the second research question ‘What scale can be developed for developing EFL materials based on critical pedagogy?’, based on the extracted themes, a scale was developed in six categories including defining CP-based objectives, developing CP-based content, encouraging CP-based teaching methods, encouraging CP-based evaluation procedures, defining CP-based roles for teachers, and defining CP-based roles for students. The developed scale consisted of 50 items in a five-point Likert range from 1=strongly disagree to 5=strongly agree.

The extracted themes have been more or less reported in some previous studies by some scholars among whom Abdeli et al. (2016), Colombo (2013), Daryai-Hansen et al. (2015), and Sadeghi (2012) can be mentioned. The findings are also similar to some other related studies (e.g., Colombo, 2013; Honnett, 1992; Taylor, 1992) that argued that CP-based education seeks the highest level of objectives sought by education. Therefore, it can be argued that CP-based development of EFL materials is not constrained to instructing English skills to the students. It also covers social, financial, political, and cultural matters. CP-based EFL materials development should therefore transcend the boundaries of traditional and mainstream education, and seek to make society, economics, ethics, ethnicity, and gender of the students connected with teaching and learning EFL.

Consistent with this study, Mostafazadeh, et al. (2015) explored the main dimensions of transformative education and showed that a

transformation-based curriculum revolves around a variety of dimensions including anti-racist pedagogy, taking advantage of diversity and multiculturalism, educational and social justice, diversity in educational methods, plurality of evaluation procedures, acceptance of variety rather than sameness, supporting minor languages, and encouraging multicultural and inter-cultural communication

The findings also do support the findings of Aikman and Unterhalter (2007) who argued that EFL should be learned in an immune anti-discriminatory environment that is oriented toward democratic values, taking advantage of economic, political, and cultural opportunities and values. Similarly, as argued by UNESCO (2003), EFL curricula and teaching methods and techniques should be free from stereotypes, race discrimination, inequality of learning opportunities, etc.

The findings of the study are also in line with Gollnick and Chinn (2002) who argued that teachers should seek different methods to make students familiar with different cultures, and simultaneously encourage them to respect their own cultures. As believed by Gollnick and Chinn (2002), in post-modern era, EFL classes are characterized by the presence of students from different linguistic, social, and cultural backgrounds; therefore, teachers should identify effective methods to teach these students by using pedagogical approaches that are culturally responsive. Also, Raitskaya and Tikhonova (2019) in their research study implied the importance of intercultural communication which is supposed as one of the key points of critical pedagogy

In the same vein, it has been argued in some previous studies (e.g., Adams, 2004; Aikmann & Unterhalter, 2007; Gollnick & Chinn, 2002; Subrahmanian, 2005; Unterhalter, 2007; Wilson, 2003) that EFL materials should aim at encouraging democratic stances including attitudes and values, reducing hegemony in terms of culture, ethnicity, and race, developing learners' knowledge of different races and ethnicities, and providing the ground for education of minorities. The belief behind this is that belonging to different minority groups should not make any learner deprived of learning opportunities. In this way, justice, indiscrimination, lack of hegemony and marginalization, and equity will be encouraged and promoted (Mohammadi, et al., 2016). Furthermore, students' cre-

ativity and criticality are enhanced, and their knowledge of races and ethnicities is developed (Sadeghi, 2012).

The stance taken by some scholars (e.g., Bic Ngo, 2010, as cited in Abdeli Soltan Ahmadi, & Sadeghi, 2016) is that if CP is followed in ELT, the content of the curriculum can contribute to main shifts in the educational environments through paying heed to opinions and ideas of various cultures, social classes, races, and ethnicities, regardless of membership of individuals in different groups, and without belittling different cultures and races. This leads to learners' empowerment so that they can change the existing affairs locally and globally.

6. Conclusion

In line with the findings of the study, it can be concluded that if EFL materials are going to be developed based on CP, first, some objectives should be defined based on CP principles. Then, in developing the content of the materials, CP principles should be taken into account. That is, content development should be conducted based on CP. Moreover, EFL materials should be developed in a way that CP-based teaching methods and evaluation procedures are encouraged. Last but not least, EFL materials are recommended to be developed so that the roles assigned to teachers and learners are based on CP and its constituent principles.

In this way, students who are members of different major and minor groups can equally be provided with academic and educational materials in different educational settings. Moreover, the materials can produce basic shifts in the educational system by paying attention to the voices of different groups of learners, regardless of their group membership.

Finally, in line with the findings, it can be concluded that teaching and evaluation methods should be diverse, instead of limiting students to some old mainstream learning and assessment opportunities. Moreover, room should be left for creativity, criticality, and individuality of learners. In so doing, teaching and evaluation methods should be participatory and cooperative, incorporating the views of students of different cultures, races, ethnicities, and social classes; and they should be

based on negotiation, discussion, and dialogue, using exploratory teaching methods which are built on the direct and active involvement of the students with the learning problems.

References

- Abdeli Soltan Ahmadi, J. and Sadeghi, A. R. (2016). Designing and validating the multicultural curriculum model in Iran's public education. *Journal of Curriculum Studies (J.C.S.)*, 10(39), 71-108.
- Abdollahzadeh, H. and Haddad Narafshan, M. (2016). The practicality of critical pedagogy: A case study of Iranian EFL learners' motivation. *Studies in English Language Teaching*, 4(2), 196-207.
<https://doi.org/10.22158/selt.v4n2p196>
- Adams, J. (2004). *Room 13 and the contemporary practice of artist-learners*. Retrieved from room13international.org/wp-content/.../Room-13-article-Jeff-Adams-Goldsmiths.pdf
- Adel, S., Egtesadi, A., and Sadeghi, F. (2019). Construction and validation of a critical pedagogy questionnaire to assess ELT teachers: A mixed-method study, *Issues in Language Teaching*, 8(1), 333-375.
 doi: 10.22054/ilt.2020.46289.421
- Aikman, S. and Unterhalter, E., Eds. (2007). *Practicing gender equality in education*. Oxford, Oxfam GB.
- Akbarpour, L. and Sahragard, R. (2016). *Pedagogy of possibility for EFL learners: Principles, application, and course development*.
<https://doi.org/10.22108/are.2015.15500>
- Aliakbari, M. and Allahmoradi, N. (2012). On Iranian school teachers' perceptions of the principles of critical pedagogy. *International Journal of Critical Pedagogy*, 4(1), 154-171.
- Aliakbari, M. and Azimi Amoli, F. (2014). Teachers' awareness of critical pedagogy: A case study of Iranian EFL teachers. *European Online Journal of Natural and Social Sciences*, 3(1), 128-134.
- Aliakbari M. and Sadeghdaghighi, A. (2013). Teachers' perception of the barriers to critical thinking. *Soc. Behav. Sci.*, 70(25),1-5.

Alvandi, M., Mehrdad, A. G., and Karimi, L. (2015). The relationship between Iranian EFL teachers' critical thinking skills, their EQ and their students' engagement in the task. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 5(3), 555-565. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.17507/tpls.0503.15>

Barjesteh, H., Alipour, B., and Vaseghi, R. (2013). Critical pedagogy: Improving Iranian EFL learner's reading comprehension ability through CP strategies. *Indian Journal of Fundamental and Applied Life Sciences*, 3(3), 335-341. <http://www.cibtech.org/jls.htm>

Birjandi, P. and Bagherkazemi, M. (2010). The relationship between Iranian EFL teachers' critical thinking ability and their professional success. *English Language Teaching*, 3(2), 135-145.

Brosio, R. (2000). *Philosophical scaffolding for the construction of critical democratic education*. New York: Peter Lang.

Capper, C. (1993). Educational administration in a pluralistic society: A multiparadigm approach. In C. Capper (Ed.), *Educational administration in a pluralistic society* (pp. 7-35). New York: SUNY Press.

Childs, K. (2017). Integrating multiculturalism in education for the 2020 classroom: Moving beyond the melting pot of festivals and recognition months. *Journal for Multicultural Education*, 11(1), 31-36. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/JME-06-2016-0041>

Colombo, M. (2013). Introduction. Pluralism in education and implications for analysis. *Italian Journal of Sociology of Education*, 5(2), 1-16.

Darder, A. (1991). *Culture and power in the classroom: A critical foundation for bicultural education*. New York, Bergin & Garvey.

Daryai-Hansen, P., Gerber, B., Lorinez, I., Haller, M., Ivanova, O., Krumm, H-J., and Reich, H. H. (2015). Pluralistic approaches to language in the curriculum: the case of French speaking Switzerland, Spain and Austria. *International Journal of Multilingualism*, 12(1), 109-127. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14790718.2014.948877>

Davari, H., Iranmehr, A., and Erfani, S. M. (2012). A survey on the Iranian ELT community's attitudes to critical pedagogy. *English Language Teaching*, 5(2), 101-111. <http://dx.doi.org/10.5539/elt.v5n2p101>

Enyew, S. and Melesse, Ch. (2018). The integration of multiculturalism into the Ethiopian universities' environment. *Research in Pedagogy*, 1, 52-62. <https://doi.org/10.17810/2015.70>

- Freire, P. (1970). *Pedagogy of the oppressed*. New York, NY: Continuum.
- Freire, P. (1993). *Pedagogy of the oppressed*. New York: Continuum.
- Giroux, H. (1983). Theories of reproduction and resistance in the new sociology of education: A critical analysis. *Harvard educational review*, 53(3), 257-293.
- Giroux, H. (1994). Doing cultural studies: Youth and the challenge of pedagogy. *Harvard educational review*, 64(3), 278-309.
- Giroux, H. (2010). Social education in the classroom: The dynamics of the hidden curriculum. In H. Giroux & D. Purpel (Eds.), *The hidden curriculum and moral education* (pp. 100-121.) Berkeley, CA: McCutchan Publishing Corporation.
- Gollnick, D. M. and Chinn, P. C. (2002). *Multicultural education in a pluralistic society (6th ed.)*. New York: Merrill.
- Honnett, A. (1992). *Kampf um anerkennung*. Frankfurt: Suhrkamp.
- Jorshari, B. K. and Akbari, R. (2013). An investigation of EFL learners' attitudes toward critical pedagogy and its impact on their academic writing achievement. *Journal of Social Issues and Humanities*, 1(7), 140-148.
- Larson, K. R. (2014). Critical pedagogy(ies) for ELT in Indonesia. *TEFLIN Journal*, 25(1), 122-138.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.15639/teflinjournal.v25i1/122-138>
- Lie, A. (2016). The multicultural curriculum: Education for peace and development. *Human Rights Education in Asian Schools*, 81-102.
- Mahmoudi, Khoshnood and Babaei (2014). Paulo Freire critical pedagogy and its implications in curriculum planning. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 5(14), 86-92.
- Mohammadi, Sh., Kamal Kharazi, S. A. N., Kazemifard, M., and Pourkarim, J. (2016). Proposing a model for multicultural education in higher education: Investigating experts' opinions in Iran. *Journal of Research in Teaching*, 4(1), 65-91.
- Mostafazadeh, E., Keshtiaray, N., and Ghulizadeh, A. (2015). Analysis of multi-cultural education concept in order to explain its components. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 6(1), 1-14.

- Parker, J. L. (2019). Multicultural education as a framework for educating English language learners in the United States. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Perspectives in Higher Education*, 4(1), 22-35.
- Pishvaei, V. and Kasaian, S. A. (2013). Design, construction, and validation of a critical pedagogy attitude questionnaire in Iran. *European Online Journal of Natural and Social Sciences*, 2(2), 59-74.
- Rafi, M. S. (2010). Promoting critical pedagogy in language education. *International Research Journal of Arts & Humanities*, 37, 63-73
- Rahimi, A., Kushki, A., Ansaripour, E., and Maki, A. (2015). Critical pedagogy and materials development; content selection and gradation. *Educational Policy Analysis and Strategic Research*, 10(1), 24-38.
- Raitskaya, L. and Tikhonova, E. (2019). A university course of intercultural communication: Fostering students' skills and competence. *Rural Environment. Education. Personality*, 12, 152-157.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.22616/REEP.2019.019>
- Roohani, A., Hashemian, M., and Haghparast, Sh. (2016). Validating a context-specific teacher critical pedagogy questionnaire. *International Journal of Research Studies in Language Learning*, 5(4), 3-12.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.5861/ijrsl.2015.1313>
- Sadeghi, A. (2010). Reviewing the national curriculum of the I.R. of Iran using a multicultural approach. *Journal of Curriculum Studies (J.C.S.)*, 5(18), 190-215.
- Sadeghi, A. R. (2012). Characteristics and necessities of developing a multicultural curriculum in Iran. *Cultural Strategy*, 18, 93-121.
- Shabani, M. B. (2014). An investigation into the role of Iranian EFL teachers' critical pedagogical views in their educational success. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 5(1), 144-150.
- Shangarffam, N. and Rahnama Roud Poshti, N. (2011). The relationship among EFL teachers' critical thinking, self-efficacy, and their perception of effective teaching. *The Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 4(1), 175-207.
- Subrahmanian, R. (2005). *Scaling up good practices in girls' education*. Paris: UNESCO.
- Taylor, C. (1992). *The politics of recognition*. Princeton: Princeton University press.

Taylor, R., Kumi-Yeboah, A., and Ringlaben, R. P. (2015). Pre-service teachers' perceptions toward multicultural education and teaching of culturally and linguistically diverse learners. *Multicultural Education*, 23(3/4), 42-48.

Tomlinson, B. (2011). *Material development in language teaching (2nd Ed.)*. Cambridge University Press.

UNESCO. (2003). *EFA global monitoring report 2003/4: Gender and education for all: The leap to equality*. Paris: UNESCO.

Unterhalter, E. (2007). Global values and gender equality in education: Needs, rights and capabilities. In S. Fennell & M. Arnot (Eds.), *Gender education and equality in a global context: Conceptual frameworks and policy perspectives* (pp. 19-34). London and New York: Routledge.

Wei, K. (2018). The misconstruction of the postmodern curriculum at the beginning of the 21st century in mainland China: From the perspectives of curriculum culture. *Journal of Literature and Art Studies*, 8(12), 1732-1746. <https://doi.org/10.17265/2159-5836/2018.12.014>

White, R. E., Cooper, K., and Mackey, W. (2014). Culturally relevant education and critical pedagogy: Devolution of hierarchies of power. *Revista Internacional de Educacin para la Justicia Social (RIEJS)*, 3(2), 123-140.

Wilson, D. (2003). *Human rights promoting gender equality in and through education, Background paper for EFA global monitoring report 2003/04*. Paris: UNESCO.

Zohrabi, Kh., Razmjoo, S. A., and Ahmadi, A. R. (2019). Developing and validating a pluralistic curriculum (PC) model for English teaching in Iranian high schools. *Journal of Modern Research in English Language Studies*, 6(1), 31-49. <https://doi.org/10.30479/jmrels.2019.10021.1265>