



Comparison of Effectiveness of Compassion-Focused Therapy and Acceptance and Commitment Therapy on Difficulty in Regulating Emotion in Female Students with Oppositional Defiant Disorder

Zohreh Jalali¹, Parviz Asgari^{2*}, Ali Reza Hedarei²,
Behnam Makvandi²

1. Ph.D. Candidate, Department of Psychology, Ahvaz Branch, Islamic Azad University, Ahvaz, Iran.

2. Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Ahvaz Branch, Islamic Azad University, Ahvaz, Iran.

Citation: Jalali, Z., Asgari, P., Hedarei, A. R., & Makvandi, B. (2021). Comparison of effectiveness of compassion-focused therapy and acceptance and commitment therapy on difficulty in regulating emotion in female students with oppositional defiant disorder. *Journal of Woman and Culture*, 12(48), 55-68.

DOR: 20.1001.1.20088426.1400.12.48.5.0

ARTICLE INFO

Received: 03.01.2021

Accepted: 11.05.2021

Corresponding Author:

Parviz Asgari

Email:

Askary47@yahoo.com

Keywords:

Compassion-focused therapy
Acceptance and commitment therapy
Emotion regulation difficulty
Oppositional defiant disorder

Abstract

The aim of the present study was to compare the effectiveness of compassion-focused therapy and acceptance and commitment therapy on emotion regulation difficulty in high school girl students with oppositional defiant disorder. The statistical population included all high school girl students in Ramhormoz city in the academic year of 2018-2019. Subjects were selected by random sampling method from girls high schools in Ramhormoz city. The research method was an experimental with pre-test, post-test and control group design. The sample number for each group was about 20 subjects with oppositional defiant disorder. Therapeutic methods at both levels of compassion-focused therapy and acceptance and commitment therapy were considered as independent variables and emotion regulation difficulty as a dependent variable. Emotion regulation difficulty scale (Gertz & Romer, 2004) was implemented to collect data. The first experimental group was treated with compassion-focused therapy of Gilbert (2014) and the second experimental group was treated with acceptance and commitment therapy of Hayes & et al. (2012). Compassion-focused therapy sessions were performed in 8 sessions of 90 minutes once a week and acceptance and commitment therapy was performed in 8 sessions of 90 minutes once a week. Multivariate and univariate analysis of covariance and Ben Foroni post hoc test were used data were analyzed using SPSS software version 24 and the significance level was equal/less than 0.05. The results showed the efficacy of both therapies on emotion regulation difficulty in female high school students with oppositional defiant disorder and the superiority of acceptance and commitment therapy over compassion-focused therapy.



Extended Abstract

Introduction: Oppositional Defiant Disorder (ODD) is a behavioral disorder in the children. It is crucial due to it may cause cognitive defiance, mood irritability, hostility, impulsivity, and inability to control emotion regulation in children. Two common therapies were suggested as effective treatments: compassion-focused therapy and acceptance and commitment therapy. Compassion-focused therapy could be effective on the desire of the individuals for helping the others and create inner peace and a sense of security. Acceptance and commitment therapy also could be effective to control emotion dimension and anxiety in people who have ODD disorder. The aim of the present study was to compare the effectiveness of compassion-focused therapy and acceptance and commitment therapy on emotion regulation difficulty in high school female students with oppositional defiant disorder.

Methods: The statistical population included all high school girl students in Ramhormoz city in the academic year of 2018-2019. Subjects were selected by random sampling method from girl high schools in Ramhormoz city. The research method was an experimental with pre-test, post-test and control group design. The sample number for each group was about 20 subjects with oppositional defiant disorder. Therapeutic methods at both levels of compassion-focused therapy and acceptance and commitment therapy were considered as independent variables and emotion regulation difficulty as a dependent variable. Emotion regulation difficulty scale (Gertz & Romer, 2004) was implemented to collect data. The first experimental group was treated with compassion-focused therapy of Gilbert (2014) and the second experimental group was treated with acceptance and commitment therapy of Hayes & et al. (2012). Compassion-focused therapy sessions were performed in 8 sessions of 90 minutes once a week and acceptance and commitment therapy was performed in 8 sessions of 90 minutes once a week. Multivariate and univariate analysis of covariance and Ben Foroni post hoc test were used data were analyzed using SPSS software version 24 and the significance level was equal/less than 0.05.

Results: The results indicated that compassion-focused therapy was significantly effective on emotion regulation difficulty in high school girl students with oppositional defiant disorder. The finding also showed that acceptance and commitment therapy had significant effect on the emotion regulation difficulty in high school girl students with oppositional defiant disorder. Finally, the results revealed that there was significant difference between compassion-focused therapy and acceptance and commitment therapy efficacy on emotion regulation difficulty in high school girl students with oppositional defiant disorder and the superiority of acceptance and commitment therapy over compassion-focused therapy.

Conclusion: The results showed the efficacy of both therapies on emotion regulation difficulty in female high school students with oppositional defiant disorder and the superiority of acceptance and commitment therapy over compassion-focused therapy. To explain the finding of the research it could be discussed that due to emotional and impulsive characteristics of children with ODD, coherence and adaptive regulation and management of emotion in these individuals which were caused by the applied therapies



led them to moderate negative and positive feelings and better understanding of the situation so, they could learn how to manage their emotions. Considering the results of the research it could be concluded that acceptance and commitment therapy should be applied to those children with ODD to help them to reduce their emotion regulation difficulty.

Author Contributions: Zohreh Jalali: general framework planning, content editing and analyzing, submission and correction. Dr. Parviz Asgari: collaboration in general framework planning, selection of approaches, final review and corresponding author. Dr. Ali Reza Hedarei and Dr. Behnam Makvandi: designation and implementation of approaches and conclusion. All authors reviewed, reviewed and approved the final version of the article. This article was extracted from PhD dissertaion of Zohreh Jalali, supervisered by Dr. Parviz Asgari and the counseling advisinsy of Dr. Alireza Hedarei and Dr. Behnam Makvandi.

Acknowledgments: The authors thank all individuals who have helped us in this research.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declared there is no conflicts of interests in this article.

Funding: This article did not receive any financial support.