

## The Role of Cultural Identity in *The Lord of the Rings*: A Focus on Stuart Hall's Theoretical Approaches

Hadiseh Alishiri<sup>1</sup>, Hossein Moradi<sup>\*2</sup>, Fazel Asadi Amjad<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1,2</sup>Department of Language and English Literature, Karaj Branch, Islamic Azad University, Karaj, Iran

<sup>3</sup>Department of Foreign Languages, Kharazmi University, Tehran, Iran

DOI: [10.71864/LCT-2025-1198162](https://doi.org/10.71864/LCT-2025-1198162)

Received: 23/07/2024

Revised: 25/12/2024

Accepted: 03/02/2025

### Abstract

The Lord of the Rings by J. R. R. Tolkien intricately examines identity, power, and resistance by looking at the different races of Elves, Dwarves, Hobbits, and Men in Middle Earth. These races reveal other aspects of culture, history, and values, which show Tolkien's concern concerning identity and belonging. The nature of cultural identity as fluid, contested, and constructed by Stuart Hall will help us to understand these complexities. Hall's ideas about cultural hybridity and representation, as well as change and tradition, help us make sense of Tolkien's identity complex. The self-imposed isolation of Elves is mirrored in the plight of Dwarves, which parallels the suffering of the destitute. The Hobbits' transformation from the Shire entails deeper themes of strength and change, as these motifs transcend geographically. The Fellowship represents diversity in depth. Their cooperation for the greater good shows how people can work together despite their differences. Through this perspective, Tolkien discusses a pluralistic cultural identity where no culture dominates the other. The Lord of the Rings instead of a fixed identity focuses on diversity and ,shared goals, emphasizing resistance belonging, and change.

**Keywords:** Cultural identity, Cultural hybridity, Power and resistance, Tradition and modernity, Globalization

### 1. Introduction

For many readers and critics, J. R. R. Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings* is a tale of heroism and adventure, however, it deals with many other issues too, like cultural identity, power, and resistance. In Middle-earth,

\* Corresponding Author's E-mail address: [moradi.hossein@gmail.com](mailto:moradi.hossein@gmail.com)



This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

the Elves, the Dwarves, the Hobbits, and the Men are presented as having individual cultures, histories, and religions. These aspects of their lives are not immutable but are fluid and constantly recreated because of power struggles, historical moments, and relations with others. One of the strongest voices about cultural studies, Stuart Hall, offers a very beneficial attitude for us. His theories concerning cultural identity as an unfixed phenomenon, contested, politically enabled, and articulated are the concepts through which we can view Tolkien's literature. For these reasons, *The Lord of the Rings* can be placed into the context of contemporary anxieties about identity and difference (Fimi, 2009).

For those people who experience composite identity, this complex identity renders them perpetually stuck in two cultures and neither of them completely embraces them, which in turn, will never give them a sense of belonging. They feel disengaged from various aspects of native customs and traditions, leaving them trapped in two worlds. This duality emphasizes the intricate blend of two cultures (Soltani, et al., 2023).

Struggles are a reality that surrounds us wherever we go, and every civilization has faced its own unique sets of hurdles. In all these conflicts, it is clear that the search for identity and trying to understand oneself has always posed deep-rooted issues across cultures and civilizations. Throughout history, the world has experienced the rule of specific groups who dominated others. It is common for them to impose standards to help retain power. Such impositions, cultural, social, or political in nature have always stifled individual autonomy by making them fit into expected stereotypical molds. Still, one's desire to deeply understand and define themselves has lived on without succumbing to such pressure and has allowed for resistance, self-exploration, and the reclaiming of one's identity. This conflict and balance between imposed authority and one's will illustrate how identity is a crucial component of human existence (Darvishian et al., 2024).

Stuart Hall's treatment of cultural identity does argue that it is not something that is given and received, it is an active process that is ever-evolving. In the paper "*Cultural Identity and Diaspora*" Halls describes Identity as two different ways of conceiving about a thing: one is whether it is a collective history that is shared or how everything can be disjointed and contentious in the global context (Hall, 2015). This counters the thesis that sentiments and identities are perennial, detailing the narratives of how identities are defined, created, and altered in turn by wider social and historical factors and situations. In the case of *The Lord of the Rings*, the cultural identity of the Elves, the Dwarven kinds, and other races possess,

finds definition and influences from their history, their language, and whatever other people inhabiting the land had as their cultural architectural architecture. But they are never in a sense only that: their everyday life activities are cultural activities and everyday life interactions with other people and cultures reconstruct them which is what Hall's reiteration of post-structuralism is that identities are never constant.

The key terms of, politics of difference and power, are fundamental in the creation of Middle-Earth cultural identities. Sauron's quest for dominance is a textbook example of cultural imperialism; he seeks to extinguish every other identity and impose his own all-encompassing identity on everyone. This persecution that was experienced by the Free Peoples can be perceived as a struggle against independence from the subjugation of the dominant culture and a call for self-determination, as is shown in Hall's analysis of the construction of identity of the subjugated groups, within the predominant cultures (Hall, 1997). The One Ring is a cultural dominance-based symbol; it accurately portrays the consequences of power for its own sake and how the dominant identity can destroy both the existence and the sense of self of marginalized subjects. Frodo's psychological burden of bearing the Ring becomes a metaphor for the psychological pain and cultural repression associated with resisting hegemony that is best understood in the context of postcolonial identity crisis as elaborately detailed by Hall (Hall, 1997).

To sum up, *The Lord of the Rings* skillfully illustrates the multifaceted nature of cultural identity and the construction of identities through representation, power relations, and resistance. The theories of Stuart Hall give such insights into these relations, In a world marked by globalization, identity politics is described as multifaceted, multilayered, and constantly changing. When we analyze the dynamics of race, ethnicity, and power in Middle Earth, the way Tolkien's work addresses wider issues of identity, belonging, and resistance is noticeable. In the present world of globalization and cultural pluralism, *The Lord of the Rings* is as relevant an analysis as ever on the importance of cultural identity (Hall, 1997).

This study is important in bridging literary and cultural studies by examining J. R. R. Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings* using Stuart Hall's theories. The essay analyzes cultural identity through Hall's articulation, representation, and hybridity, providing a new lens through which to view Tolkien's work, as well as through his works by examining the multifaceted nature of identity portrayed in the piece. This methodology expands the scope of the understanding of *The Lord of The Rings* with an example of the applicability of Hall's theories to works of fiction by

demonstrating how identities are constructed, represented, and negotiated in the literature. The study also focuses on the significance of cultural identity in globalization and diaspora for individual and collective identities.

The significance of this study also lies in the ability to critique power, representation, and identity as concepts that dominate literature and the real world. Examining Tolkien's characters and societies as they interact with different aspects of their culture sheds light on the intricate processes of identity formation in a globalized world. Such an analysis broadens the understanding of Tolkien's literature in a manner that proves Hall's ideas are still relevant in the discussion of global culture. The look at identity building in various texts sets a wide sphere for research for literary and cultural studies, marking it as valuable in the academic field.

## 2. Literature Review

Lavezzo (2021) in her essay reexamines Tolkien's academic and creative endeavors alongside his rejection of Stuart Hall's proposition for his assistance with a graduate thesis on William Langland at Oxford. It argues that just as West Indian immigration concentrated around his university town, one of the reasons for that is Tolkien's vision of white medievalism. The essay first looks at Tolkien's medievalism holistically, stressing that he created a national mythology because he possessed an ancestry connected to the language and myths of the people. It then offers an analysis of his fiction portraying heroes possessing the language and attributes of their ancestors. Then, it looks at the disaster that wiped out Atlantis. This idea comes from Tolkien's imagined memories of his ancestors, showing why it's important to embrace different viewpoints, such as Stuart Hall's. Finally, it addresses the challenges medievalists face with Tolkien's epic fantasies (Lavezzo, 2021).

Brown in her essay entitled *Remembering and Forgetting: National Identity Construction in Tolkien's Middle-earth* asserted that in Europe's medieval era, the integration of oral forms and classical mythology gave rise to epic poetry, which served the purpose of preserving cultures, delivering moral lessons, and comforting people in times of need, thus marking the rise of prose in a vernacular setting. These pieces were documented in monastic scriptoria and were preserved by being passed down which assisted in constructing memory and identity. Just like in Tolkien's Middle Earth, these nations create and recreate their identities through folktales, songs, and memorials while being judged by others for their moral actions. Indeed, the most striking feature of these self-serving histories is the retrospective "amnesia" where it is needed. This paper

traces the strands of Tolkien's concern with cultural memory and identity, drawing comparisons between the peoples of Middle-earth and medieval. It looks at Flieger, Rateliff, Geary, and Bhabha and discusses remembering and forgetting as the foundation of national identity (Brown, 2024).

In *Stuart Hall and the Framing of Diaspora*, Andrews explains that Hall's research on diaspora, especially his exploration of the Black diaspora experience in post-WWII Britain, deeply shaped his work. Hall's work gave new meaning to the concept of diaspora and his approaches to understanding notions of identity. These identities have constant metamorphosis in how they are formed, negotiated, and expressed in a transnational world. Hall's work on this issue started in the 1980s, a time known for its xenophobic racism towards the Black population and the emergence of neoconservatism, and has continued up to now. He analyzes his view on diaspora within the context of post-war Black visual arts and cultural identity, to critically address his arguments, including the productive ones and the ones that have raised criticism. It also accounts for how global migration shifts and evolving dynamics reshape the concept of diaspora. Reflecting on Hall's work over 40 years after it first emerged, highlights how his ideas remain vital for exploring diaspora, identity, and culture in our modern world. This examination also shows how crucial Hall's work remains in understanding the representation of diasporic existence in art, culture, and society (Andrews, 2025).

### **3. Methodology**

Cultural identity within the context of *The Lord of the Rings* was analyzed through Stuart Hall's perspective. This essay applies a qualitative textual analysis technique. Hall's theories regarding cultural identity, articulation, representation, and hybridity make it possible to engage with J. R. R. Tolkien's work on multifaceted intersections of identity, power, and culture. The methods are grounded on Hall's writings such as *Cultural Identity and Diaspora* (1990), *Representation: Cultural Representations and Signifying Practices* (1997), or its extensions like Homi Bhabha's *The Location of Culture* (2012).

The analysis begins with Hall's interpretation of articulation, history, culture, and identity. The characters as well as the societies within *The Lord of the Rings* are critically examined with the intent of collecting the context around their existence. Particular attention is paid to Hall's arguments and cultural identity theories, which explain it as a social

construction rather than a fixed essence. This framework is geared towards understanding how Tolkien's fictional races such as the Elves, Dwarves, and Hobbits, define and express their identities through history and customs.

Additionally, the essay looks at Hall's work on the politics of representation focusing on systems of representation and their power relations. In this regard, the essay looks at race, ethnicity, and power relations in the *Lord of the Rings* and how some identities are constructed or erased by the story. Lastly, the hybridity as described by Hall and furthered by Bhabha is used to discuss the amalgamation of cultures and identities in his works, especially where globalization and diaspora are concerned.

The primary text of *The Lord of the Rings* is studied with Hall's theoretical writings and specific academic works to understand the essence of cultural identity in the narrative. It examines important issues of identity, power, and representation in Tolkien's imagination and at the same time the relevance of Hall's works to identity issues in the context of globalization.

## **4. Discussion**

### ***4.1. Cultural Identity within Middle Earth: Racism and Ethnicity***

*The Lord of the Rings* authored by J. R. R. Tolkien, depicts an amalgamation of races: The Elves, Dwarves, Hobbits, and Men which have distinct cultures to them defined by their languages, relationships with the land, and history. However, these cultures are not stagnant, they are subject to change through continuous interaction, power dynamics, and conflict between the races. One of the theorists who analyze these interactions and relationships is Stuart Hall, a British cultural theorist noted for his studies on cultural identity. Hall's assumption that cultural identity is an 'essence' is a misconception, as Hall claims, it is a 'production of history', which has a history (Honegger, 2011). As said before, in Middle Earth, the Elves, and Dwarfs are defined through the narratives and practices concerning them, however, Hall's counterargument states that these identities can be subjected to change through interaction with other beings.

For instance, the Elves, being a race, that is considered to possess superiority over others, have an idealistic cultural identity that is rooted within their history and traditions, basing itself on being pure. Their native tongue, Quenya, which is intricately detailed alongside their bond with nature showcases a culturally diverse identity. However, this idealistic

identity that the Elves possess can also be viewed quite negatively as it in a sense prohibits and limits them as their deep idealistic identity prevents them from engaging with the Dwarves and Men. According to Hall, cultural identities are not inherent, rather they are constructed with the help of inclusion and exclusion processes (Hall, 2015). Elves, for instance, choose to stay isolated in Valinor, never disclosing themselves to other races. They prefer to keep their distance, always shielding themselves from outsiders. Such processes can be termed as the tensions accruing from the interplay between such processes as cultural preservation and adaptation. This process is at the heart of Hall's work and also in Tolkien's account of the decline of the Elves (Shippey, 2014).

The Dwarves, on the contrary, are presented as more materialistic racially, cut off from other Elves and races. Conflict is a central archetype that shapes their structured chaos. Such validation of identity, based on the past is now spun into threads that make the whole shawl of marginalization. Hall pinpoints similar patterns of marginalization of the subaltern within the margins of dominant culture (Hall, 1997). The pride and stubbornness of the Dwarves culturally embody politically coded conceptions of resistance. Politics of representation, for instance, is well captured by Gimli about pride or Shang and Dwarves regret not getting respect but later turn allies telling of respect winning over cultural differences. This recolonizes the history by refusing the conflict between Elves and Dwarves. This encourages rethinking cultural attachments, viewing them as products of conversation. (Tolkien, 1986). The way Hobbits live shows that they are rural communities with life untouched by machines but when their adventure begins, they are exposed to a world of ideas and perspectives that shake up their worldview and prove Schirato and Yell's theory that changing history and society influencer identity (Fimi, 2009).

#### ***4.2. The Elves: Ethnicity as a Dying Species Orientalism and Focusing on Separation from The World***

The Elves in J. R. R. Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings* presents ideal Elves as a form of ethnicity that worships everything pure, their worship of nature and ancient things is also admirable. Their language (Quenya), as well as proficiency in arts, crafts, and magics, represents them as sophisticated but with a strong sense of culture. But this form of ethnicity is also a form of idealization as Elves do not seem to fully integrate with Dwarves along with other men, part of the reason for this is the contamination of the ethnicity. Stuart Hall's concept of cultural identity as

a process is unhurried and hot contested here (Hall, 2015). Hall argues that group identity is most sometimes being formed or shaped through inclusion and exclusion processes in which division becomes too far to maintain intact such a sense of ideal the way things and customs are Elves Keen to continue both their ways of life and spirituality, even when they are cut off from others due to idealization.

The most identifiable and self-fulfilling aspect of the Elves is their decision to return to the Undying Lands or Valinor, and not consider joining the rest of the races in Middle Earth. This attitude was somewhat reinforced by their wish to maintain their cultural and esoteric metaphysical boundaries, even as it encourages them closer to fading into oblivion. Galadriel's decision to reject the One Ring, despite its enormous power, offers a glimpse into why her Elven culture entrusted such a profound and weighty responsibility. (Tolkien, 1986). This can be seen as an example of the Elves' tendency to negate themselves and believe firmly in the principle of self-sufficiency and respect for their culture. At the same time, this self-imposed exile offers a further explanation for the cultural stagnation that stems from the Elves' unwillingness to expand to a changing environment, which brings about their downfall. Hall's acknowledgment of cultural identity as fluid and ever-changing puts into perspective how lacking an identity focused chiefly on exclusion and purity (Drout, 2006).

The Elves' dedication to cultural purity is shown in how they view other races. Their long-standing conflicts with the Dwarves, rooted in a tense and uneasy history, reveal just how little they are willing to engage with outsiders. Legolas's first experience with Gimli and the Fellowship is no closer to a future without prejudice than the Elves: Gimli and Legolas have a small rivalry between the two tribes of dividing prejudice right from the start (Tolkien, 1986). This friendship is an expression of cultural integration, one that conquers all boundaries, but in Middle Earth, such friendships are not common. The Elves' choice to isolate themselves acts as a way to protect their culture, but it also creates boundaries that prevent their society from evolving. Hall's idea of "articulation" is helpful here because it helps explain how certain elements—like history and traditions—are emphasized shaping and defining their unique cultural identity. (Hall, 2015).

The Elves are proud of their race and their cultural traditions, however, there are both benefits and obstacles to this cultural exclusivism. Their outstanding clinging to a significant culture renders them remarkably enduring. This very attachment however cuts them off from the Middle-

Earth's fabric of struggles and all the more from the fight with Sauron. Cultural identities, as Stuart Hall puts it, are not fixed 'things' but are actively constructed as a result of tensions, interactions, and transactions between subjects. This persistent avoidance of the Elves to adapt to that fluidity speaks to the weaknesses of an exclusionary and pure culture (Hall, 2015)

#### **4.3. The Dwarves: Marginalization and Resistance**

The Dwarves from J. R. R. Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings* are presented as an oppressed people, who are in search of a place in the cultural spectrum of Middle Earth. Their existence is defined by a turbulent past and ongoing struggle for survival against dragons, the Orc race, and other enemies of their existence. Such marginalization parallels Stuart Hall's examination of subalterns and their identity formation within oppressive schemes. Hall avers that such groups, upon exclusion from mainstream narratives, tend to promote and protect their cultural aspects, which can be seen in the Dwarves' boasting of their great abilities and strong attachment to their lands (Shippey, 2014).

Crafts and the earth from which the Dwarves emerge mainly as miners and metalworkers significantly shape their cultural identity. So, these activities are not merely economic but also the basis of their identity and social cohesion. For instance, Buhari Shahr Chini-tam Brown (Erebor) and Moria do not exist as mere geographical locations but represent Dwarven essence and strength. All these changes and Dwarves tend to lose their recognition when their identities are threatened such as during Smaug's attack on Erebor or when Balrog attempted to destroy Moria (Tolkien, 1986). This demonstrates Hall's contention that cultural identity is often synonymous with specific places and practices which can be places of conflict and contestation.

The Dwarves although no longer the focus practice cultural resistance, expressing their identity and culture through customs, resisting dominant culture. Gimli's expression of Thorin's heritage, and Moria Dwarves If Seems Quite Sturdy have superimposed these relationships, after every conflict, such cross-culture comes as a priority. Contrary to the long-standing stereotype of all the elves poring over the woods, Gimli and Legolas set several cultural Leonardo of elf and dwarf which discards this animosity. All this shows that cultural identities can be changed, they were never static, through more dialogue and exchange (Tolkien, 1986). According to Hall's view, however, this is a type of cultural resistance, with the Dwarves affirming their identity but also in the political struggle

against Sauron. Hall's view on the politics of representation is also pertinent in this instance as the Dwarves seem to defy and resist the stereotypes and discrimination that have been in place against them for ages (Hall, 1997).

#### **4.4. Modernity and Tradition through the Eyes of Hobbits**

The Hobbits of J. R. R. Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings* embody a pastoral lifestyle, heavily intertwined with tradition, familial ties, and the soil itself. Such loving attributes bear simplicity, modesty, and togetherness in the Shire which serves as the last retreat of pastures. While such lively culture remains supreme, the activities of the War of the Ring compel the Hobbits to experience the cultural decays and alterations that come with the advent of alteration. Stuart Hall' believes cultural identities aren't fixed but are constantly reshaped by global events, social changes, and outside influences. (Curry, 2004). The Adventure of the Hobbits from the closed-off living of the Shire to the crisis in other parts of Middle-earth is such a cultural adjustment.

The tale opens up when the Shire is characterized as a British resort cut off from the development, unrest, and devastation that other locales of Middle-earth are experiencing. Farming, eating, and revering grandfathers and customs set the lifestyle of Hobbits. This demonstrates Hall's contention that culture is derived from individuals' memories, histories, and traditions that they have in common which give them a sense of fulfillment and togetherness (Hall, 1997). However, the arrival of Gandalf and the mischief of the One Ring tend to take them out of this peaceful existence and introduce them to mess and danger, a new forgiving environment. This end of the peace marks the beginning of modernity into a traditional way of life, one which the Hobbits were never accustomed to.

Frodo's departure and move especially feature a social and cultural shift. While exploring Middle-earth, he meets various bands of customs like Elves, Dwarves, and Men, who practice distinctly diverse customs and traditions. Such interactions help break Frodo's extremely close-knit understanding and force him to confront the multi-faceted nature of the world as it was at that time. This complements Hall's point that culture isn't a fixed or static concept. Instead, it's constantly evolving because it's shaped by people and their engagement with one another. (Hall, 2015). Frodo's understanding even to people like Gollum of those who aim to be a different person even within them, suggests a challenge to mutual understanding devoid of cultural homogeneity. Yet, the Lolita effect

forever marginalizes Frodo, as a different man from what he used to be after experiencing those things, and thus can never go back to Shire again.

As a direct result of modernity, it is noted how fragile cultural identity is during the ‘Scouring of the Shire’ wherein the Hobbits are shown fighting against Saruman’s forces to establish a foothold on their homeland. It was noted how the industrialization of the Shire by Saruman was a clear encroachment and an effect on traditional practices. The Shire being successfully restored by the Hobbits does showcase the inevitability that change can be fought against, but at the end of the day, the change will still come. Cultural identities, as Stuart Hall mentions, are in a state of constant shift interspersed with modernity in some shape or form (Bratman et al., 2021). The ability to change their identity while keeping their core values shows that the Hobbits can culturally renew themselves. In the end, the story is a strong reverberation of the importance cultural identity holds within a fast-paced world.

#### ***4.5. Hybridity and the Fellowship***

The Fellowship in *The Lord of the Rings* by J. R. R. Tolkien alludes to cultural hybridity which is a concept that Stuart Halls explores in detail as about associations with identity. The Fellowship of the Ring gathers together Hobbits, Elves, Dwarves, and Men, all of whom are different races that make a unified group for understanding the existence of various ethnic and cultural traits. Hall states that hybridization is a form of coexistence whereby cultural identities are blended and reassembled into new and dynamic articulations that defy a blunt society and social order (Bhabha, 2012). This idea is mirrored in the formation of the fellowship in that when forming it, members have to battle the history of prejudice and cultural differences to fight against Sauron. This cultural interaction coincides with Hall's reasoning that nations and nationalistic sentiments are not natural facts; they grow and adapt through negotiations and transactions with other nations and peoples (Hall, 1997).

Aragorn, one of the important members of the Fellowship, is a hybrid character in that he is at the intersection of Men and Elves. His parents were from two different cultures which enables him to interrelate two entirely different worlds and influences therefore enriching the fellowship and enhancing the performance of the fellowship. For instance, he can speak Elvish and holds a great respect for the Elven way of life which makes it easier for him to connect with different societies in Middle-Earth. This aligns with Hall's notion that hybrid identities can dismantle overly stringent borders and forge an area in which constructive dialogues can take place (Bhabha, 2012). As observed, Aragorn's leadership is a great

demonstration of the tendency of cultural hybrids to unify and strengthen in the presence of danger or in times of need.

What's more, the history of Frodo in the Fellowship additionally brings forth the border-altering ability of this cultural mix. As a Hobbit who lived in the isolated Shire, Frodo cuts the embodiment of a rustic and conservative as he starts. But as he meets more Elves, Dwarves, and Men, he is pushed to experience a multifaceted world where all three combine. Hall's assertion that cultural identities are not fixed and maintained but devised during interactions and experiences is also evident (Hall, 1990). The fact that Frodo, for instance, manages to feel pity for Gollum when looking distinct from himself is a sign of the realization of the possible inclusion of various conceptions in one form of culture. However, this change doesn't come without consequences since due to the impact that these events had on him Frodo is never able to go back to living in the Shire as he had previously.

The successful effort of the Fellowship to destroy the One Ring indicates the ability of the amalgamation of cultures to consolidate and achieve common objectives. By going beyond their particular cultural differences, the members of the Fellowship illustrate the capacity for a wide diversity of cultures to be one. Such a view argues that all cultures are dynamic and continuously reworked by histories and social processes (Chance, 2010). The experiences of the Fellowship of the Ring teach a lot about the essence of working together and respecting one another against common problems. In the end, their experience points out the increasingly relevant role of cultural hybridity when battered by the rapid changes taking place in the world.

#### ***4.6. The Politics of Difference and Power***

Within the cultural imaginary reconstructed by J. R. R. Tolkien in *The Lord of the Rings*, the universalist values of difference and power occupation are crucial in crafting the identities of the various races inhabiting Middle-earth. An understanding of these relations is enriched by Stuart Hall's concepts about cultural identity and power. Hall claims that forms of cultural identities are never neutral but are always within some power systems and representational structures that maintain and promote inequality of powers (Hall, 2015). In Middle Earth, Sauron's desire to reign over all beings represents the ultimate form of cultural imperialism. He searches to establish a single, negative identity across the entire land. Sauron's opposition, which is commanded by the Free Peoples, can be understood as cultural imperialism and the occupation of

the oppressed masses, a struggle and conflict that is consistent with Hall's description of a politics of difference and oppositionality.

The One Ring is an important representation of the authoritarian character of culture and the negative effects of power. The Ring's corruption of its owner exemplifies the evils of sovereignty and the destruction of native cultures by dominant ones. The task that Frodo had of containing the Ring functions as a metaphor for the psychological and cultural condition of being antihegemony, which complements Hall's arguments on the postcolonial self (Hall, 1997). The power of the king over other characters such as Boromir who wants the ring so that Gondor may be strong, indicates the power of cultural expansion and the internal conflicts generated by it.

The Scouring of the Shire shows a powerful reminder of how easily cultural identities can be obliterated. The advancement, in this case, destroys the Hobbits' peaceful way of life as Saruman forces industrialization onto their land. Post resistance, reclamation, and restoration of the shire, the hobbits portray how much their culture means to them, but at the edges also accept that change is unavoidable. The episode stands in contrast with Hall's assertion that cultural identities are in a state of constant flux due to the spectrum of modernization and age-old traditions (Drout, 2006). Furthermore, the scenes when the hobbits reluctantly conform to change yet safeguard their distinctiveness demonstrate the prospects of cultural rejuvenation when subdued to external pressures .

Any deep-dented and long-standing conflict is rooted in hostile competition for resources, and the dreadfully violent past that Elves share with Dwarves is no different, this elaborates the politics of difference and power within the middle earth. The friendship between Legolas and Gimli, built on mutual respect during their time in the Fellowship, stands as a wondrous testament to how ancient cultures can be honored and understood despite their histories. In this way, Hall's concept of articulation is explained, in that he sees cultural identities as formed through the combination of different constituents and the absence of others such as history, tradition, and the like (Hall, 1997). The fellowship's ability to break such differences and come together against a common foe, however, illustrates the true potential for unity amid crises.

Stuart Hall's theories provide a robust framework to analyze the power and difference embedded in the cultural identity intersection's representation and politics. *The Lord of the Rings* toggles themes like race, ethnicity, and power, showing how Tolkien's work goes beyond

imagination. It connects with modern struggles around identity, belonging, and resistance. In a hybrid world, shaped by globalization, this masterpiece stands as a powerful narration of the relevance of culture .

#### ***4.7. Cultural Identity: Power and Identity Politics***

J. R. R. Tolkien raises an alarming question, exploring whether it is possible to be culturally relevant and timeless as well, as an ambivalence regularly felt by many, closely inclined to Stuart Hall's exclamatory open theory regarding change. Hall maintains that cultural identities are not fixed, but rather, are always in motion due to the changing historical and social factors, especially when cultures are under pressure from other cultures (Hall, 2015). In Middle Earth, this conflict is illustrated by the clash of the traditional Elven cultures with the new world of Men. The Elves with deep knowledge of nature and magic traditional arts belong to a troubled cultural identity. But their abandonment of Middle Earth towards the close of the Third Age indicates a close of this order which is shifting towards a new rule of the Men. This change agrees with Hall's view of cultural identities as a spectrum, moving from hyphenated connections to a blend of local history and modern influences.

The Shire, the settlement of the Hobbits, stands out as one of the outstanding illustrations of the conflict between the relics of history and contemporary influences. At the offset of the tale, the Shire is idealized as a cultural sanctuary free from the industrial revolution and war that other regions of Middle Earth suffer from. Hobbit's life is driven by cultivating land, having casual breakfasts, and entertaining their ancestors by following the traditions. This is consistent with Hall's proposal that cultural identities are rooted in shared history and traditions, providing stability and a sense of belonging. But the moment Gandalf arrives and the One Ring is discovered, this tranquil existence is altered forever as Frodo and his friends find themselves in an uncertain and threatening environment. The very disruption suggests the encroachment of modernity into an evolving civilization, compelling the Hobbits to reconcile with altered circumstances.

The Scouring of the Shire, also displays how the hobbits are lost to Saruman and then attempt to take the lost land of the shire, emphasizing the vulnerability of cultural identity against the background of modernity. Saruman's change of the Shire painfully shows the harm caused by anarchic development on its people. The Shire, as Frodo and the rest try to bring it back after getting defeated was a symbol of reconciliation for the hobbits, but that they were bound to change as well in one way or the other (Bratman et al., 2021). Saruman's transformation of the Shire

painfully shows the harm caused by the reckless development of its people. They balance their essence with the ability to change in the face of many aspects of culture which can provide hope for cultural evolution.

The Elves' departure from Middle-earth at the end of this trilogy further illustrates their point about cultural change. You've seen the decision of Elves regarding their gender races, their world chose to migrate rather than invent, and decided to stay and become. This presents Hall's evaluation that modern cultures are built on histories, that are often forgotten or erased over time. The Leaving of the Elves signifies the passing of time when the future belongs to the new and impacted, multicultural, and mobile cultural hierarchy. This transition is examined in Hall's concept of culture as a constant metamorphosis that integrates change and movement in its identity (Hall, 2015).

Therefore, it can be said that *The Lord of the Rings* significantly deals with the issue of the relationship between modernity and tradition at great length, exposing the intricacies of cultural representation systems, power, and powerlessness. Stuart Hall's theories may be useful when analyzing these phenomena because they seek to emphasize the fact that identity is not fixed in the context of globalization. The interplay between the traditional and contemporary aspects of Middle-earth serves as a glimpse into the identity issues and the sense of belonging and resistance that pervade the wider society, which was a concern of Tolkien. In today's globalized world, where cultures increasingly mix, Tolkien's portrayal of cultural identity remains deeply relevant as a timeless philosophical work.

## 5. Conclusion

Tolkien showcases within his work a variety of cultures where the Elves, Dwarves, Hobbits, and Men exist and with those dives into the questions of belonging and the relationship with each race to say history as well as the religion they practice. If one were to view the work of Tolkien through a lens of Stuart Hall's theory it would be accurate as Stuart Hall's work focuses on identity and sees it as not a solid foundation but a relatively fluid concept as it is constructed. Middle-earth evokes a deeper pursuit of examining the more relevant societal issues that prevail worldwide such as the notions of belonging and resistance through the lenses of race, ethnicity, and power.

The accents the Elves have of romanticism and their pursuit of tradition which ultimately leads them out of the Middle Earth accent the issues between the past and present. . Hall's assertion that cultural identities are constructed through processes of inclusion and exclusion is supported by

their unwillingness to accommodate changes in the world. In the same way, the Resistance of the Dwarves and the significance they place on their identity show how some groups that are on the margins manage to reconstruct themselves about the larger culture. For the Hobbits, the 'broader struggles' of Middle-earth serve as the perfect context as they can foster difference rather than avoid it; this merging of cultures empowers the Hobbits' vision. Such dynamics are what Hall would call the expanding or fluid nature of one's cultural identity, shaped and reshaped by various events occurring in time and space.

The Fellowship of the Ring provides a compelling illustration of cultural hybridity and a challenging hope for unity out of diversity. The Fellowship brings together persons from different races and backgrounds, epitomizing the need for unity, respect, and cooperation to overcome the crisis they face. This is in support of Hall when he asserts that cultural identities remain always in the process of being formed because of interactions and exchanges that take place. The end goal of the Fellowship to obliterate the One Ring directly sits at the apex of cultural integration, underscoring the fact that with sufficient collaboration, division can always be overcome. This complements Hall's assertions regarding the ability to overcome cultural gulags and subjugation through unity and unyielding strength against trends of mass globalization (Gramsci, 2020).

Even though globalization and colonialism were at their peak during the events of *The Lord of The Rings*, Tolkien's piece stands the test of time while simultaneously reiterating the importance enveloped around unique cultural discords in an ever-more evolving civilization. There are so many nuances in terms of cultures, identities, belonging, and transformation that Tolkien inadvertently managed to highlight through his efforts. The insights provided by Stuart Hall's approaches greatly assist in navigating through these shields of intricacies. This work highlights the importance of preserving unique cultures, even in a world that often urges blending and conformity.

As *The Lord of the Rings* invites further discussion and essay writing, this study suggests that scrutiny of the text through Stuart Hall's lens reveals cultural complexity and interaction in ways that have not been done before. One of the possibilities is exploring how cultural identity is constructed in Middle-earth through language and myths. Especially how Tolkien's languages like Elvish or Dwarvish and his mythologies are used to express and safeguard culture. A new way to study this work could involve exploring gender and power in *The Lord of the Rings*, focusing on Galadriel, Éowyn, and Arwen. It would examine how these characters

navigate power dynamics within a patriarchal system, using Hall's ideas about representation and power. The topic of hybridity can also be examined further by studying the interethnic relations and conflicts within Middle-earth, for example, the Elves and Dwarves or the assimilation of Hobbits into the grander scheme of the War of the Ring. These conversations could also embrace Michael's adaptation of *The Lord of the Rings* and what insights can be gathered from his movies about how Peter Jackson's visions of cultural identity differ from or are the same as those of Tolkien. These arguments would not only add to the scholarship on Tolkien but also highlight the significance of Hall's theory in understanding identity, culture, representation, and literature.

**Funding:** This research received no external funding from any agency.

**Conflicts of Interest:** The authors declare no conflict of interest.

## References

- Andrews, M. T. (2025). Stuart Hall and the Framing of Diaspora. In *The Routledge Companion to African Diaspora Art History* (pp. 19-29). Routledge.
- Bhabha, H. K. (2012). *The location of culture*. Routledge.
- Brown, S. (2024). Remembering and Forgetting: National Identity Construction in Tolkien's Middle-earth. *Journal of Tolkien Research*, 19(3), 8.
- Chance, J. (2010). *The Lord of the Rings: The mythology of power* (Rev. ed.). University Press of Kentucky.
- Curry, P. (2004). *Defending Middle-earth: Tolkien, myth and modernity*. HarperCollins.
- Darvishian, G., Yaghoobi Derabi, J., & Shahabi, H. (2024). Responding to Neoliberal America: A Jamesonian Reading of David Foster Wallace's *Girl with Curious Hair*. *Journal of Language, Culture*, 7(1), 1-18. <https://doi.org/10.71864/LCT-2024-1129879>
- Drout, M. D. C. (Ed.). (2006). *J. R. R. Tolkien encyclopedia: Scholarship and critical assessment*. Routledge.
- Fimi, D. (2009). *Tolkien, race and cultural history: From fairies to hobbits*. Palgrave Macmillan.
- Bratman, D., Neville, K., Rogers, J., Reid, R. A., Fisher, J., Houghton, J. W., & Magoun, J. (2021). The Year's Work in Tolkien Studies 2018. *Tolkien Studies*, 18(18), 275-330.
- Gramsci, A. (2020). *Selections from the prison notebooks*. International Publishers.

- Hall, S. (2015). Cultural identity and diaspora. In J. Rutherford (Ed.), *Identity: Community, culture, difference* (pp. 222–237). Lawrence & Wishart.
- Hall, S. (Ed.). (1997). *Representation: Cultural representations and signifying practices*. Sage Publications, Inc; Open University Press.
- Honegger, T. (2011). The Rohirrim: “Anglo-Saxons on horseback”? An inquiry into Tolkien’s use of sources. In J. Fisher (Ed.), *Tolkien and the study of his sources: Critical essays* (pp. 116–132). McFarland.
- Lavezzo, K. (2021). Whiteness, medievalism, immigration: rethinking Tolkien through Stuart Hall. *postmedieval*, 12(1), 29-51.
- Shippey, T. (2014). *J. R. R. Tolkien: Author of the century*. HarperCollins.
- Soltani, H., Salami, A., & Hanif, M. (2023). Challenging Gender Discourse and the Maternal in Society: An Analysis of Female Agency in Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie’s *Americanah* within the Framework of Irigaray’s Theory. *Journal of Language, Culture, and Translation*, 6(1), 33-48.  
<https://doi.org/10.30495/lct.2023.1105228>
- Tolkien, J. R. R. (1986). *The Lord of the Rings*. HarperCollins.